

[music]

Gretchen Brion-Meisels: Welcome, thank you for enduring this filming. It's very exciting. We are basically trying to do things to the extent that we can as normally as possible, but because we move so much in this class, and because filming is a little more complicated for them that it might be in a class where things are a little more static.

A couple announcements, one, if you have not yet --you have everyone's signature one way or the other? Okay. Two, there's going to be at least two different moments when we're working in groups today and the microphones and filming of group work is always going to be at this center table. If you are willing to sit down at the center table at some point, we will need you there, but if you don't want to have a focus on you in a small group, then you just don't sit at that table and you won't. Does that make sense?

There's one activity and I'll say it again when we get to the activity where we're switching groups very often and my hope is that a bunch of people will stand there for two minutes and then go somewhere else so that we get a mix, but however it happens, happens. Carlyn had an announcement.

Carlyn: Yes. April is Sexual Assault Awareness Month. A group of survivors at HGSE have started an Instagram account, if people are able--

Gretchen Brion-Meisels: Do you want to tell it to me?

Carlyn: Yes.

Gretchen Brion-Meisels: I don't know how to write Instagram accounts down, but I'll try.

Carlyn: It's hgse_survivors, and we're trying to get more followers, so if people could follow, like all the photos that are currently there, read the stories, and then also we would love to have extra comments. If everyone in here can comment on at least a couple and just say, "I believe you," that would be wonderful. Thank you.

Gretchen: Any questions about that? I'm going to write the comment down here. Kristen, do you want to share your announcement? The flyer for Kristen's announcement is up next to this Instagram note.

Kristen: I have extra some of them that people would like to take copies. The Disability Service Office is having a talk with Tom Hehir, the professor here at HGSE. Laura Shifters also a professor here and then Michael Stein professor in the law school is a visiting professor. They're having a roundtable book talk next Monday, sort of a luncheon one to two about the books, how did you get here, students disabilities and their journeys to Harvard, and then disability and equity at work. If you're interested, I have extra flyers and there's one right here

Raul: [unintelligible 00:02:50]

Gretchen: Awesome.

Kristen: There you go.

Raul: [unintelligible 00:02:55] people, so [unintelligible 00:02:59] please come. We have reserved seats for two people so please, please come. Also, to follow up on that, sorry, there's a Latin [unintelligible 00:03:06] there's a Latin Education Conference 2018 [unintelligible 00:03:13] conference from the 14th, next Saturday, from 9:00 to 6:00. Again, it's a very long day, but please register, it's going to be really interesting. I have a schedule for the speakers . It's going to be a great networking opportunity and also a great learning opportunity. I think we're going to [unintelligible 00:03:29] can stay the whole time [unintelligible 00:03:31]

Gretchen: Is there a website for that, Raul?

Raul: I dont have the website, but I do have the information.

Gretchen: Okay. You can send it to me and I'll send it out.

Raul: Yes, perfect.

Meg: Can I one more

Gretchen: Yes, go ahead, Meg.

Meg: I think somebody mentioned this before, but the Boston area educators for social justice conference is this Saturday from 8:30 to 4:00 [unintelligible 00:03:49] and it's totally free and it seems relevant to this class, because there are multiple sessions that are youth-led, and there are youth performances and you helped to organize the conference. If that's

[crosstalk]

Gretchen: If you want to send that information to me, I can send that around to you, I might have sent it but I don't know.

Meg: They do have a website.

Gretchen: Go ahead.

Student: Sorry, so Arlan and I, next-- you guys have seen the booth Rural Education Week so a bunch of us are really pushing for HGSE at large to talk about rural ed because it's not talked about and it's not just in the context of the United States, but also globally there will be LGBTQ youth also, Gretchen, you're also.

Gretchen: That one was epic. Good. Next week is Rural Education Week, there's a lot of--

Student: Every single day, there's different panels and events on different topics.

Gretchen: Awesome, and Monday is one that I'm sitting on, which is I'm moderating, actually. I'm not sitting on it, but around LGBTQ youth in rural schools, so I encourage you to come to that. Then, lastly, I've mentioned this before, but Monday morning, there's a free workshop with folks from El Salvador who are coming to

teach about popular education and their work in El Salvador. There is a link to sign up for that which I think I sent out for this class, but I can compile this stuff and send it out again. If anyone who made an announcement wants to send it my way, and that's going to be from 10:00 to 12:00 in Larson GO-6. There is an RSVP thing, but even if you don't get to RSVP, if you end up wanting to come, go for it.

Thank you for all the announcements. We're going to start now. We're going to start with our transition in and our transition in was brought by Emily and there are two. Do you want to say something about it and then I'll start the first one and then you can come up with--

Emily: What's the first one then?

Gretchen: Which one do you want first?

Emily: Probably [unintelligible 00:05:37]

Gretchen: Okay, that's what we have.

Emily: I taught in Phoenix. [unintelligible 00:05:42] Arizona for four years, the last four years. I was interested in [unintelligible 00:05:49] going on there and so I was trying to find the full video and I couldn't find any that weren't white students, because it was like white students are more active in the movement in Phoenix, which is ironic given that the majority of students that attend public schools in Phoenix are children of color, most of their life as students. This video kind of raises some tension for me, not because I don't think all youth need some organizing. It's just like this tension of whose voices or experiences are being elevated through this movement, and what it means to be like a white ally on this movement and what that means. Yeah

Gretchen: We'll start again.

[video starts]

Female: I remember it's a vivid memory when Sandy Hook happened, it really affected me as a kid and I wasn't even there. I wasn't personally a part of any-- I wasn't personally affected by the shooting. To hear that as a, I think, 10 year-old, it really hurt because I didn't know that things like that happened. I just remember being so affected by it and as school years went on, I figured there's some people out there that are really sketchy and I don't know where they are. I don't know if they're really in the right headspace, but I'll tell you, I even call it an irrational fear of mine, but at this point in our governmental system, I don't know if it's considered irrational anymore to be scared to go to school. Personally, I fear going to school.

Male: I was never scared to go to school until probably now. The Parkland School where it happened, that was a safe school. It was a safe neighborhood. Unfortunately, for [unintelligible 00:07:53] a nice neighborhood. I go to a nice school in Mezzo but a quiet suburb. That's the kind of school that was shot up just last week and knowing that it could happen, literally anywhere, and just brings it home to me knowing that my life might be jeopardized one day at school. In our own school, we do have an arms resource officer, checking around the school. One thing

that I recently saw just yesterday was a lot of my classrooms, they don't even have door handles on door, on our push, and I wouldn't be able to even pull the door shut.

[video ends]

Gretchen: Okay, so do you want to say anything about the second one?

[video playing]

Gretchen: Do you want to say anything about the second one?

Emily: Yes, this is-- I'm from [unintelligible 00:08:54] both speeches that came out of the DC march. This was an LA students' story. I just thought it was very interesting contrast to the experience shared just now and just highlight the importance of making sure all student new experiences are elevated equally.

Gretchen: Awesome. Thank you. I can't remember exactly where I missed them. I'm going to stop it at the same point.

Emily: [crosstalk] you can start at 30 seconds and the rest of it is just [inaudible 00:09:35]

Gretchen: Why can't I click? This one is really, Somebody help me. Let's just turn it on and listen to her then. Why waste our time. We can hear them.

[video starts]

Emily: Right now, they're saying the name of her brother who was killed by a gunfire.

Edna Chavez: I lost more than my brother that day. I lost my hero. I also lost my mother, my sister and myself to that trauma and that anxiety. If the bullet did not kill me, that anxiety and that trauma will. I carry that trauma everywhere I go. I carry it with me in schools, in class, walking home and visiting loved ones. I am not alone in this experience. For decades, my community of South Los Angeles has become accustomed to this violence. It is normal to see candles. It is normal to see posters. It is normal to see balloons. It is normal to see flowers honoring the lives of black and brown youth that have lost their lives to a bullet.

How come we cope with it when our school district has its own police department? Instead of making black and brown students feel safe, they continue to profile and criminalize us. Instead, we shall have a department specializing and restorative justice. We need to tackle the root causes of the issues we face, and come to an understanding on how to resolve them. I am here to honor the Florida students that lost their lives and to stand with the Parkland students. I am here today to honor Ricardo. I am here today to honor Stephen Clarence. I am here today to uplift my South LA community.

[crowd cheering]

[video stops]

Gretchen: I'm going to stop it there although I love listening to her. Thank you, Emily. I think those two together are really helpful, an interesting way to also encourage us to keep thinking about the ways in which bringing youth together across communities can really influence the dialogue, so that youth can start to understand and stand in solidarity with each other across communities.

All right. Our class for today is going to be around adult-youth relationships. I wanted to spend the first few minutes, as I promised, giving people time to think about their rubric for the final project. Some of you have already done that work which is awesome. If you have already done it, then you can use these 10 minutes either to support someone else at your table who has questions, or to think about whether or not there's anything you want to change on yours. On the center of each table are new versions of the blank rubric with the spaces in between as promised.

Because some of you indicated that rather than adding whole new rubric areas, you would like to further clarify how you will do the part of the rubric that I've already included. I'm going to give folks 10 minutes to just finish these up and think about what you want to jolt down on them. After 10 minutes, I'm going to collect them from you. If you're not done, then you can still send me an updated version later. If you remember, these are iterative, okay?

During those 10 minutes, I will play a little bit of music. People can work on their rubrics. If you haven't had a chance to get food, you're welcome to do that as well. Then we'll come back together and start talking about adult-youth relationships. If you have questions, of course feel free to call us up.

Kristen: I'm trying to find my-- the one with your comments on it. Yes, but I can't-- I think this is it. I'm trying to schedule a to chat with the More Than Words people. I feel like a while. They have a lot of really strong practices, so I think maybe taking from that and thinking about creating a toolkit that's like, "This is what you do now and here is how to make it," like participatory and partnered.

Jess: It would be a toolkit for More Than Words?

Kristen: For other organizations who want to be more like them.

Jess: The tool kit would be inspired by materials in More Than Words [unintelligible 00:14:43] ?

Kristen: Exactly.

Jess: You would be adding more to it?

Kristen: I would be adding more and thinking about how if I took for example a really traditional evaluated approach for you, for example the way that the Boys & Girls Club, like the YMCA evaluate their youth employees, their lifeguards and camp counselors and then say like, "This is what you do right now. Here is how to make it." There's a toolkit to making it a partnership approach for growth instead, and thinking about it as like rather than pitching to someone that partnership is a value. Saying this is how you can insert moments of partnership and moments of youth participation, youth voice into your approach.

Jess: Okay, so the audience for it would be--

Kristen: Would still be a organization that doesn't take a partnership approach right now.

Jess: It would be an educational setting, like a after-school, like a remedial center [crosstalk] .

Kristen: Or a place that hires many, many young people similar to More Than Words, but that takes hiring in people for a really different perspective than More Than Words does. It's what I'm starting to think, just because of having-- I don't know, that's what it feels like [unintelligible 00:15:56] being guided, which I know is different than this.

Jess: That's [unintelligible 00:16:02] understandable and natural. Then my next question is, what would be your goal as in having conversation [unintelligible 00:16:12] .

Kristen: So it sort of would be like, why have you taken this approach? What inspired you to work with people who developed it originally and people who continue to implement it? Why does it work and why is it meaningful for you and for these youth? Then also to arrange time to go and talk to [crosstalk]

Gretchen: Jess and I are going to look at the drafted rubrics and we will tell you if we have any concerns or have feedbacks about your rubrics. That's why we're doing it today. Don't worry about doing something wrong, just do what you think is in the spirit of what you're going for.

Kristen: They're taking to both sides.

Jess: Talking to both sides. Yes. Okay, so you would still be aiming to speak with young people at the site?

Kristen: Yes.

Jess: Okay, so then I think [crosstalk] implementing their materials. That way what you're ultimately creating as a product , is a reflection of the way their work could be pushed further, not in a way that's a critique of More Than Words, but it's just going to be your argument and analysis essentially about what they have included, so that you're pushing something out into the world that's beyond what they already have in their [unintelligible 00:17:39] model. I would also check with them [unintelligible 00:17:45] with them because you want to give them credit [crosstalk]

Kristen: Oh my gosh, yes, and maybe give them some thoughts and whatever.

Jess: Completely. I think that makes sense. Does that feel feasible for you?

Kristen: Yes. It feels more feasible only because it feels like there's many things that success could look like. Because depending on how the conversations go, it might pivot or shift or whatever a little bit, but it seems like that's okay to the extent that I'm still able to have something by the 26th, that's like ready to present and share.

Jess: I would say in your company, if your product does not include that language around the pitch to an organization, I would say that in the paper, in the presentation that you do for the class, you'd want to have that rationale still. Identify the issue and adopt [crosstalk]

Kristen: I still might make it like addressing an organization and group of organizations that hire lots of youth and don't take a partnered approach.

Jess: You set the context and then you talk about what's currently in [unintelligible 00:18:54], and then you bring in this one, but you don't have to follow this flow im just thinking through my own process, so the components of it. You'd be sharing this model of what could be and what its impact is in a different setting, and then bringing back tools that could be [crosstalk]

Kristen: Like how the YMCA could do these things, like places that are old and are like historically not even considered youthful, I'm sure.

Jess: Then, in grounding in the context that you'd be able to say why this could be particularly helpful [unintelligible 00:19:28] YMCA, so that you avoid the risk of them saying like "That's them, not us"

Kristen: Totally. That makes sense. Okay, and then I guess my one other question would be, so I had previously planned a literature review, which I had started a little bit about performance evaluation and I think I might shift that to be a literature review about youth hiring.

Jess: Let me see the thing again. Yes.

Kristen: Just shifting what that context is.

Jess: Okay. Right, so it's not performance evaluation [crosstalk]

Kristen: Exactly. More about like youth employment.

Jess: Okay. Got it.

Kristen: Sort of shifting it to when did people start hiring youth? Why do people hire youth? What does it mean to hire youth in thinking about more of that context, and then using More Than Words as a different approach to that work.

Jess: Okay, so then the tools that you're looking at for More Than Words are more than their evaluation, so that makes sense.

Kristen: Sort of their full-- because they have like a really robust process in place about how they-- and especially because they work with a system involved youth, it's like, obviously, a slightly different approach because of rules.

Gretchen: Hey, so we have about three minutes.

Kristen: Just a really thoughtful job.

Jess: So it's youth hiring as a context , but it's also a specific populations of youth that might especially benefit from that sort of set up context within an educational setting. The one I would say is that-- Have you been in touch with Gretchen about More Than Words?

Kristen: I have not.

Jess: [unintelligible 00:21:03] there are students who I think have actually been [crosstalk] at More Than Words historically. If you don't get a chance to talk directly with people who are working there right now, you might be able to work with some people who have worked there before and it reflects on their experiences, it might also be possible to--

Kristen: I think I'll be able to.

Jess: Yes, to see [crosstalk] but it seems like this back and forth will result in something--

Kristen: Yes, we're on our way. I was also out of town for Passover, so it was mostly me being like, I'm not here. I can't, so now I'm back and ready hit the ground running. Okay, cool.

Jess: Okay, does this feel good for you?

Kristen: Yes.

Jess: All right, great.

Kristen: I did not do this, but I will start it.

Jess: You can email that to us.

Kristen: Okay. Thank you.

Kristen: What types of things did you write in your plan?

Emily: [unintelligible 00:22:02] What?

Kristen: Are you actually going to do?

Emily: Like here?

Kristen: No, no, no.

Emily: These?

Kristen: Yes.

Emily: I'm going to design an online course for district researchers.

Gretchen: I don't hear perfectly. My hearing which is good with little kids, but you need to say things very loud.

Student 7: I have an amazing ability to tune things out, so I have--

Gretchen: It's a good skill. [unintelligible 00:22:31]

Gretchen: Okay. What's your question?

Student 7: What I ended up doing is didn't touch [crosstalk] and I adjusted these to just more accurately reflect, because they were sort of generic to be applied to anything and I just made them specifically a fight of mine, but tried to keep the spirit of each of them.

Gretchen: Yes, that's fine. We're going to look over the drafted rubric, so if I have any concerns, I'll get back to you about it. Yes, I think that that's why people were asking me to do it this way so that they could write the clarifications in, but what you did was you just changed the boxes, and that's fine too. It doesn't matter whether you change this text or you just add clarification underneath or next to it. I didn't even realize that this-- sorry, this is why she's asking for a new one. Yes, you can add clarification here, but the reason I want to collect these today is because Jess and I will read them and if we have any concerns, we'll give you feedback on them and then you can revise them, so don't worry about it. It's a good question.

Jess and I are going to look at the drafted rubrics and we will tell you if we have any concerns or have feedback about your rubric, that's why we're doing it today, so don't worry about doing something wrong. Just do what you think is in the spirit of what you're going for.

Okay, I'm going to give folks one more minute and then if you would prefer to hand it in after break, so you can have break to work on it, that's fine. I'm not trying to create extra anxiety here, but remember that nothing is set in stone.

If you're ready with your rubric, if you could put it back in the middle of your table, Jess or I will come around and grab the rubrics that people are ready with. If you're not ready, then you can hold on to it until the end of class. I just don't want to forget to collect them, but I'm going to move on for the sake of time, unfortunately. Sorry about that.

Our big topic for today is on adult-youth relationships, and the way that we're going to work through today is similar to some stuff we've done before with a graphic organizer to help us keep track of the things we want to hold on to. There are five big questions that are going to frame how we are thinking and wondering about adult-youth relationships today, and they are on the board. I'm going to read them to you in a minute, but as I'm reading them to you, what I would like to ask folks to do is to take a clipboard from the center of the table and to take one of the handouts, you will see that the handout can be used in one of two ways.

They can be used as a-- you can fold your handout into a brochure, or-- yes, which I like-- or if you prefer to have it as like a big piece of paper, you can just leave it flat. If you fold your handout into a brochure, what you will see is that each of these six or five questions, I think there's one extra and what else category on the handout is on your handout.

The questions that we're going to be thinking about today are what strategies can adults use to build strong relationships with youth? When and how are boundaries important in building supportive relationships with youth? What barriers or challenges to forming strong relationships with youth exist? How can we build strong relationships in the context of institutional rule? We started to talk about that before, and then how can or should we build relationships with youth when their families and communities hold different values than our own? That last one is one that's been coming up a lot over the weeks, so we added it as a way to think about relationship building in that context.

As we go through this, the activities we do today, I'm going to encourage you to use your little brochure handout, clipboard situation, to jot down notes of things you want to hold on to in each of these categories. Just like we've done in the past, for people who do jot down notes, we will collect those at the end, compile them and bring them back to you. This is a way of holding on to the ideas that you get across the activities we're doing today. Any questions about the purpose there?

The reason you have a clipboard is because the first activity or the second activity we're going to do, you're going to move a lot, so I thought the clipboards would be helpful. Also, I wanted an excuse to buy clipboards, so now if anybody needs to borrow 30 clipboards, you let me know.

[laughter]

All right, so we're going to start by hearing from a few students about their relationships with their teachers, and how they think about what makes a relationship with their teachers positive and as you're listening to them, again, you can think about this will probably fall down into the strategies column most likely, but what are they telling us that you might want to hold on to as you move through today?

[video starts]

Student 1: One thing about the school that I really appreciate is that the teachers they take their time to get to know you, like when you first come into the school or you're starting a new class or it's just the first week here , understanding what the classroom should be about. Sometimes you play games to get to know each other and what we like to do, like play this game [unintelligible 00:28:19] or several other games. It just helps teachers and our fellow students just to get know each other a little better.

[video ends]

Gretchen: There's going to be a series of about six students.

[video starts]

Student 2: It seem like the things and like a right way, like a smiley way, like a jumpy way, they're like, "Oh," and they're like-- Some teachers, they're so, like open to really, I don't know, really funny and they show as not a teacher, like as a friend, someone who is teaching me but a friend. It's like they're all jumping, like laughing. It's just like it's so much better.

Student 3: I wish that they understood how I am as a person instead of just another number or just another student in the classroom, who they're going to know me better and see me a lot of time, because we're all individuals, but you got to take that time individually to learn that person.

Student 4: There are some teachers that connect to you personally that you can share experiences with, but there are some that they're just about biology, biology or math, o math, that's all you hear about. I feel like if you can connect to a student, there's more there that you can put out or a student will be able to understand the situation better.

Student 5: I think teachers can help me out at school, because my family were not-- like education is not really that good. My teachers, I really I like my teachers to help me because I know when I get home, I'm not going to have that much help, that much support, so I think the teachers are a good benefit for me for my work

Student 6: I definitely think they see us as more- as their students but also as like, I guess, children [inaudible 00:30:30] , you know, just the way they cater to us and the way that, like I said before, the relationship that we're allowed to have with them, because they're so open to speaking to us about school stuff and about personal stuff as well. That means our relationship with them all that much stronger.

When they walk in the class, you'd be like, "Oh, Hi, Dr. Kaye." or "Hi, Ms. Feisner." but I mean after hours or anytime that you need them and still be like, "Oh, hey, Dr. [unintelligible 00:31:05] I'm still arguing with my mom and it's really loud i dont know if you noticed I was pretty quiet today. I was feeling down today." Or a lot of times, sometimes the teachers will just notice, because they know us so well. It's kind of like, "Everything okay?" "Are you sure everything's all right?" "You want to talk?" "You know I'm here, we can just talk about anything."

Student 7: I kind of wish they have a computer science course at school, because that's what I really want to do. I'm trying to do that, but other than that, if you're talking about a way that I learn, there have been a lot of different teachers that use a lot of good methods. Like my teacher Mr. Strauss and Ms. Jazno, they were just like really funny and really kind of down to earth, and they made me feel like I wasn't-- I was less of a student and more of a person, I guess. Although, that kind of makes it sound like my other teachers make me feel bad, but that's not true. I just like the way [inaudible 00:32:14]

Student 8: I think it's very important for a teacher to be a friend, but also to distinguish the difference that they're not your friend and that they're your teacher as well. As long as you have that type of connection where you guys can talk about things that are more than just school-related, I feel like it strengthens your relationship with the school itself, and it makes you feel a lot more comfortable in the classroom if you're speaking in front of people or just getting your work done. It's a lot easier to ask a teacher questions and come to them with problems that you have if you have a better relationship with them on a more personal level.

Student 9: I always feel like how much my teachers are actually interested in what they want from me, like what extent would they want me to go to or even some kind

of [inaudible 00:33:16] how far they want to see me achieve. Then, when I was in [inaudible 00:33:21]

Student 10: When I came to this school, they seemed like they've been with you. When I first came to the school, there's like a hundred students, so they knew everybody, they knew me, they knew how you're doing, they knew your personal life. Our school, they're very connected with their students. It's not just someone who sees me and you might not know their name. As the school gets bigger and bigger, it's surprising that everyone still knows everyone's name. It's just [inaudible 00:33:51] they don't just come to school for Facebook strangers. I love everybody there.

[video ends]

Gretchen: Okay, so I'm going to ask you to turn into your group for a minute and to just think about- talk for a minute about, listening to these young people, what are the basic building blocks that you're hearing of positive relationships between youth and adults? Okay, so just turn in for a minute. This is going to be very quick. We're going to take two minutes to just talk as a group and then I'm going to ask for people to share out. What are some of the basic building blocks that seem to be important for positive relationships between youth and adults to exist, right, to be nurtured? Okay, go ahead, turn in.

Student 1: One of the things that stood out to me was the idea of like building individual relationships and really getting to know each student and making it clear that you're invested in every single student's success.

Carlyn: I also heard quite a few times something about bringing your full selves as educators to the classroom. They mention a lot of teachers who are funny, but I also think that you don't have to be funny and still a good teacher, but if you're able to just kind of bring your own humanity and be a real person.

Kirsten: Yes, I thought it was interesting that a couple of them mentioned the relationship we're allowed to have with our teachers or they're like our friends, but they're also our teacher. Thinking about how good teachers are able to make really clear like, "I'm here for you, I'm a person who cares about you, and I want the best for you but I also have these other set of responsibilities, that sometimes might feel like it's in conflict with my personhood with you, but it's actually not, it's just like both." Which I think it's interesting that the kids were even-- I mean the relationship we're allowed to have, are they my friend or not, are they my family or not, thinking about those questions that good teachers are able to make really easy to understand. I think it's cool.

Emily: Yes, the last student who-- No, wait. I think he was the last one, when he said like he wants to know how far, like as a teacher, how far you think I can go. Well, back to what you're saying like as an individual. One thing as a teacher like, "You all are going to do great." but like-- which I guess you should do, but also individually like, "I know you are capable of this, this and this. I know, because I know you."

Carlyn: Yes. Exactly.

Kristen: And knowing the girl who was like, maybe I had a hard day and did my teacher noticed that I was like more quiet today than I usually am or that I-- like something

happened, I had a fight with my mom or whatever and I'm comfortable telling my teacher that I'm not going to participate because I had a fight with my mom, and that's that individual, like do they know that kids relationship with their mom well enough?

Carlyn: I love it how perceptive young people are, and there was one part, I don't remember who said it, but just that they could see if teachers aren't fully committed and motivated and enjoy the content. That's also like a strategy, think about if you don't-

Student 1: Yes, love your job. [laughs]

Carlyn: If you don't think the contents important, then the students won't either.

Student 1: Yes, totally. The last point that was made, that was only the last one who made something similar, but like the idea of building strong relationships amongst all the students and like where everyone is a- like feels family.

Emily: Like with each other?

Student 9: Exactly. I think that's also part of the relationship building that teacher is doing, because it's-- so I feel like it's so interconnected. Also, it could also relieve some of the burden that the teacher could be seen as a [crosstalk] -

Kristen: Yes, like the only person. [inaudible 00:37:36]

Student 1: Yes, like it's the key to the aspect.

Gretchen: Five, four three, two, one. Let's just generate. What are some of the building blocks of positive adult-youth relationships? Jess and I are going to write them up. People can just raise their hand and just share out a short sort of idea that came up in their group or that came up on your paper from either the readings or the videos. We're going to try to create a list. Go ahead, shout them out.

Student 10: The getting to know students on a deeper level, like including their name, their character and just the vibe that they give.

Gretchen: Great. Awesome. What else?

Raul: Treating each student as individual with value.

Gretchen: Great. Josie?

Josie: Relevance and making connections to the lives of your students and to your own.

Kirsten: If we want students to be passionate, teachers need to be passionate.

Gretchen: Great, keep going.

Student 2: Mutual trust.

Jess: Mutual trust?

Student 3: Consistency.

Student 4: Openness.

Gretchen: Say that once more.

Student 5: Openness.

Gretchen: Openness, great.

Student 6: Showing support.

Gretchen: Great.

Student 7: Authenticity.

Student 8: Treat students like adults, not necessarily adults, but like don't infantilize them. That's the word that I came up with but it's negative.

Gretchen: I know. That's okay. [laughs] It's true. Anything else that people want to add to this? Go ahead, Meg.

Meg: This related to [inaudible 00:39:21] and care that extends outside of the classroom, they care about you other than the 50 minutes they see you.

Gretchen: Right, Chantee.

Chantee: Yes, I just want to say like genuine care and concern.

Gretchen: Great. Arla, did you have one?

Arla: I said showing support [unintelligible 00:39:38]

Gretchen: Showing support, but you feel like its up there? Go ahead, Emily.

Emily: Carlyn said something awesome like showing your humanity, which I think it's similar, right? Showing like your vulnerability.

Gretchen: Great, Morgan

Morgan: Boundaries, but also, we were talking about this in our group. Also, opening up space to create those humanizing relationships.

Gretchen: Great.

Student 9: Notice things. Yes, so basically like the power of like seeing and being seen, and to notice things and new things that you're seeing with the young people.

Gretchen: Any last ones? Go ahead, one, two.

Student 10: Humor.

Gretchen: Humor. Go ahead.

Student 11: Building community, not just with students, but among students.

Gretchen: Yes. Okay. Are we good? A lot of these are things that we have talked about over the course of the first part of class, particularly as we were talking about this idea of working around a pedagogy of care or building around a pedagogy of relationships. Just as a way of reminding folks, I often talk about the fact that I spend about 20 minutes of every hour of my own project with youth doing games and community building, right? That's not an insignificant amount of time.

When I skip that part, because I come unprepared, it usually has a negative impact on the rest of our day, in terms of people's like ability to connect into what's happening. Plus, the students will ask like, "Wait, we didn't do a check in," right? There's certainly something that I think is carried through from our other classes around this just central importance of building trust, building community, being authentic, and open and getting to know students at a deeper level.

One of the nice things about YPAR, which is not enough, necessarily always true when you're in a classroom, and you have to follow a certain curriculum, is that you can make space to do a lot of these things, right? If you're in a classroom, often you have to get creative about how and when you're going to make space to do these things. If you're working on a YPAR project, it can be a lot easier, because you can work it into your plan, right?

This week, we did a few different readings that related to thinking about strong adult-youth relationships. We read a piece by Maria Toray, we read a piece by Jeff Duncan-Andrade. We read a piece by the group of folks who are at Berkeley, which is the YPAR-Hub folks. We read a piece by Youth on Board, which is was largely generated by youth. I want to just give you a few minutes, we're going to be drawing on these readings, but I want to give you a few minutes just to pause and think about what did you get out of the readings?

This is not meant to be a test or cause anxiety of any sort, but what do you want to hold on to from the readings. If you take your organizer pamphlet, and you look at one side, the side that has three pictures on it, you will see that you've probably already filled in some things around strategies that adults can use to build strong relationships with youth. The other two things that I think come up a lot in the readings are the barriers and challenges to forming strong relationships with youth, and then when and how boundaries can be important, right?

What I'm thinking is that you can leave this side of your handout up, and just have a conversation at your table for a few minutes, where people surface some of the things that came up for them in the readings that might be things you want to hold on to about these questions. This is going to be relatively short, and then we're going to do a moving activity with our clipboards. Okay, any questions? All right, so turn

inward, and we'll take a few minutes to just raise up things from the readings that you want to hold on to as a group around these questions.

I realized that I lied, and I'm sorry.

[laughs]

Gretchen: I forgot about this little part right now, but don't worry, because they're not going to film the whole thing, so just--

[laughter]

[crosstalk]

Kristen: This is just you being an authentically good teacher.

Gretchen: I apologize for lying.

Emily: I really appreciate your vulnerability

Kristen: Yes, thank you so much for [unintelligible 00:44:34]

[laughter]

Gretchen: But don't stress. Just generate whatever you can crosstalk

Student 1: I forgot that this was on me, so yes.

Emily: Yes. Okay. I'm natural.

[laughter]

Kristen: This is an actually excellent conversation.

[laughter]

Student 1: If I don't see this, I'll be fine.

Kristen: Yes, I think one of the things that came up in those videos and also I think came up in a couple of the readings, I admittedly did not do my closest reading of everyone this week, is that the power dynamics that are really hard to dismantle between youth and adults and how that's like a consistent challenge even in the environments where it's going really well. That challenge still exists. Just being older or younger is like societally challenging, which I thought was interesting. Like the professional researcher versus everybody else.

Emily: Yes, I think about what [unintelligible 00:45:33] like kids have in their other relationship with adults I got home and like how that might be in complete conflict

Kristen: Right, just like you're truly opposite.

Emily: Completely opposite, yes, and what that means for like the development of that co-learning.

Student 1: The other thing that I wonder is to what extent do youth like want adults? I think, as a young person, if I were with an adult, I just expect them to know something better than I do, just like by living longer. Even with my older mentors in my life, like as an adult technically, I still expect more from older people. I'm wondering if that's necessarily a bad thing, like you can try to minimize it as much as possible, but still-- maybe it's not such a bad thing that there remains that difference, because you're a teacher for a reason and not with a peer.

Carlyn: One thing I got from the Tory reading was that in any situation, there are all these different power dynamics and different relationships at play. The multiple and even opposing identities and how the age could be one thing, whether that's race or gender or whatever. All sorts of different ways that identity plays in, so being able to hold multiple identities and organize them, which is really hard.

Kristen: I thought that reading, Tori reading, was really interesting, and just this intentionality behind creating a diverse space to then do the work was really interesting to me. I feel like we hadn't sort of had a reading that covered that kind of approach before this one. Like saying it's okay that just sort of like admit that there are different things going on for different kids, but putting them in the same space can still work.

Carlyn: Yes.

Emily: I thought you were a camera for a second

[laughter]

Jess: Just like, "Don't look, don't look."

Kristen: "Don't look, don't look," all right.

Jess: No, I'm just listening to see if there's anything I should add [inaudible]

Emily: I mean everything you guys have is brilliant.

Jess: Like everything in the meeting [inaudible 00:47:59]

Emily: No, like that they just said.

Arlan: I think there's something about knowing your-- I'm not quite sure how to say it, but adults being able to know their identities and hold them well.

Emily: Yes, organized.

[crosstalk]

Kristen: I think intentionality. That sort of come up for us.

Jess: What was that last thing you just said?

Emily: Like organizing like-identities. I don't know. [laughs]

Student 1: I don't know [laughs]

Carlyn: The ability to hold multiple identities or something? I don't know. [laughs]

[crosstalk]

Jess: I'm going to come back.

Kristen: [laughs] What else did I take from the reading. I guess there's also so many different methods that people take. That I think is interesting, like different ways that they think about, like what they want to do and how they're going to do it in YPAR and then building relationships. We've talked about that a lot in this class, which I think is good, but just keeps coming back that like there's a hundred different ways to partner. There's no real right way. Sharing power looks lots of different ways. I feel like that's a big takeaway for me from this course. [laughs]

Student 1: Right.

Kristen: A lot.

Emily: That's a big takeaway [crosstalk] is the scalability is very zero -sum game in education sometimes because the solutions are just so unique to every community.

Kristen: And there's no wrong. There's often not a wrong solution. It's whatever works in your space.

Emily: Yes. That's [unintelligible 00:49:59]

Kristen: Yes, do that.

Student 1: We do that [laughs] .

Emily: We move the model across the country. We can take best practices the way they [unintelligible 00:50:11] . If I hear someone say scalability [unintelligible 00:50:14] .

Kirsten: Scalability is such a grad school buzzword [laughs] .

Emily: Especially when we're trying to view education like an industry because that's what's happening and it's well-intentioned, right?

Kirsten: Totally.

Emily: If you want to take what works and make.

Carlyn: Can we just call it knowledge sharing?

Emily: Yes.

Kirsten: Yes.

Kirsten: It's funny because it's any people field, even in people development, like adults, they do the same thing where they're like, "You have great HR practices. Let's scale them and bring them to other companies." That doesn't work because-

Emily: Cultures are different.

Kirsten: -different companies have different cultures and different types of employees and different sizes. All of these things that apply at school also apply in the world of people and yet we still try [laughs] , which was funny I think.

Student 1: I really think it's a reframing like, "This worked at my community. Maybe it might work in yours. Try it out."

Kirsten: Give a shot.

Emily: Then talking about your process of how you figure it out what works better.

Kirsten: You land on a solution that works for you.

Carlyn: One of the first students said that in the video of take your time to get to know your students which I think is, especially in this program that's just a year and so quick I find that it's-

Emily: It was.

Carlyn: -that just this program is so quick, it's so hard to actually do work in that way of running into different internships or quick projects. You don't get to really take your time even though that's so important to build those relationships and the trust to actually like make sure that you're not just dropping something into a community where it doesn't fit or doesn't belong.

Student 1: Then that's particularly at odds with when you're doing more YPAR and more research setting what you and what Gretchen seems like she does a lot because you have all these time constraints which is awful.

Kirsten: You only spend an hour a week during a semester, how much can you really do? What can you really accomplish in that time? Luckily I feel like Gretchen has the advantage of the students she works with have relationships with each other already because they're in school together, which seems like part of the battle is at least creating community amongst the team. Then you creating relationships with them is another side.

Student 1: Another side.

Kirsten: I guess when I know our boundaries and we haven't really talked about it yet. I think this article, I don't know who's it is, duh duh duh, it is The Ozer Newland, Douglas and Hubbard's article talks about the tension when the elective is created and is also doing YPAR . Talks about it briefly, but thinking about how it's you're a certified teacher and you have to give the kids a grade either way, so would you do at the front end say everyone's getting an A and let that go and how do you establish a boundary of what success looks like in the class versus in the project?

Carlyn: Arts and education and we've been talking about that a lot about how it feels wrong to grade people on their artistic or creative talent. Even here in the exercises that we have to turn in, you can see the different motivation in people. We talk about it of the classes that are graded and then what does that feel like? We don't put the same effort necessarily into the ones that aren't graded. Maybe some of the rubrics of build your own rubric and figure out how to do it.

Kirsten: We also here as adults get to choose if we want to take something pass/fail. If I want to make it graded for me versus my professor deciding that it's graded which I think is an adult's relevant interesting element of that also.

Carlyn: Are there any schools, high schools that do that?

Kirsten: I don't think so.

Emily: There's got to be.

Kirsten: I know there are schools that do mostly comments in lieu of grades, mostly in qualitative evaluation.

Carlyn: Don't allow them. That's interesting.

Kirsten: I don't think they [unintelligible 00:54:28] that.

Emily: It's ascent.

Kirsten: It's a top-down of what colleges [unintelligible 00:54:33] .

Emily: It's like they're comparing their students [unintelligible 00:54:36] even get into [unintelligible 00:54:38] require.

Kirsten: They ask for like your transcript and your GPA on the common apps. How could you have known none of that?

Kirsten: I guess the school could keep that secretly.

[laughs]

Emily: Like everyone has a 4.0.

Kirsten: Grade their students, but not have them be part of what they share with students in real-time. Then when it comes time to apply to college like, "Here's your grades." [laughs] That'd be crazy. That'd definitely freaks students and parents probably because parents also I feel like gauge the quality of the school based on if their kid improves and all those things. I think that is really interesting.

Carlyn: Then we talked about how not having grades also made a lot of us feel like the arts were soft or it wasn't a real legit practice that you have to put a lot of rigor into. Then also sometimes if you're graded then people are not motivated.

Emily: [unintelligible 00:55:45] .

Kirsten: We're talking about the struggle of grades.

Jess: Struggle of grades? Grade levels or grade grade?

Kirsten: Grade grade. When you're doing YPAR in elective class and the students anticipate receiving a grade for their work, how different that is than anything else [laughs] .

Jess: It sets up a very different relationship [unintelligible 00:56:09] .

Kirsten: Exactly. Why are we doing this? Why are we working hard? Thinking about all of those things that's very challenging boundaries.

Jess: Challenging boundaries in the same way.

Kirsten: We started the conversation based on the boundary of the expectation of grades for adults and youth and saying I still have power over your future almost because of the way that colleges and the outside world look at your GPA.

Emily: As an indicator of your merit.

Kirsten: How does an adult who wants to dismantle that do so with the knowledge that it exists? It won't go away.

Emily: That you still have to work with the system.

Kirsten: Carolyn was sharing in that they struggle a lot with grading art [laughs] .

Jess: Then what is the assessment mean and look like in the YPAR space then look like for creative one part of space or arts part space. Should there be creative spaces?

Kirsten: Creative spaces.

Emily: Sometimes I would think just from my own experience and a public school system, it's if you wanted to do it as an elective or bring it in to legitimize it to people.

Kirsten: Get buy-in from administrators and stuff like that.

Emily: You won't have to.

Jess: Justify that academic rigor.

Kirsten: Exactly. It's how do you get time allocated to things in schools? Is by justifying will the benefit effect to your students' academic growth.

Jess: In a way, the [unintelligible 00:57:49] piece intellectual rigor is one of the things that you point out as the important part of this. It's I think what a lot of YPAR scholars do when they say that it meets academic standards and goes beyond the [unintelligible 00:58:03] traditional standards of critical consciousness. Example settings like that more than others. I think also drawing that connection between a critical consciousness standard see how that is [unintelligible 00:58:18] standard

strategy properly used and is authentic. Rigor, it doesn't mean a culture shift in terms of how we think about rigor and how we think about it.

Kirsten: What does learning look like [laughs] and how do we know when someone has learned.

Jess: How do we define growth.

Kirsten: Which I think is also-

Emily: -trippy

Student 1: [laughs] .

Kirsten: -embedded in making YPAR legit in the school community and saying this is worth our time and resource allocation and whatever.

Gretchen: Let's have time for the conversation.

Jess: [laughs] .

Carlyn: It's crazy too that we have everyone talks in the videos about how humanness and humanity is important, but we don't teach that at schools. I think that is so interesting.

Jess: Teach [unintelligible 00:59:07] humanities.

Student 12: Taking a trauma and counseling class last semester and worked with a lot of counselors that were in the school and they were saying if this student tells you anything about assault or something that puts their risk at health, even though you're their confidant, you got to tell them, "I have to report this and I'm going to report this." Then you called the family and let them know, but you still put this out there whether or not the student wants just because it's the law. I didn't think this cannot be the reading and [inaudible] . That's one thing I noticed in my experience, that you really got to play that. What they did often is they were like, "Just so you know."

[crosstalk]

Gretchen: If you hear things you can add them if you hear it.

Student 13: Yes, and I can share my working, weird interests and someone would be like, "That's awesome" instead of being like, "What a freak." [laughter]

Student 14: I knew this dude who was really into bird watching and he missed class sometimes to compete.

Gretchen: Wow, there's a competition in bird watching?

Student 14: You have a time limit and then you have to identify some of the birds within the time limit and then-

Student 13: That sounds stressful, honestly.

Gretchen: Very stressful and also a little unfair because you can't control what's going to fly in front of you.

Student 14: Right. You have to know where to stand in the woods or how to-
[crosstalk]

Gretchen: Wow, but wait, how did this come up? What was the initial thing you were saying?

Student 13: Well, I was saying being interested-

Gretchen: Oh, being interested.

Student 13: -both sharing interests with students, but also even if you're not interested in something, that's awesome that you're into that. I'm interested in hearing about that-

Gretchen: Yes, totally.

Student 13: And it's just really interesting because students are really interested-
[crosstalk]

Gretchen: People are interesting. Yes. Exactly, exactly.

[inaudible 01:01:19]

[crosstalk]

Gretchen: I'm just going to put a dot here so I remember which one it is.

Student 16: That's like cultural appropriation in ways that I would feel not only as a student, I wouldn't feel connected in that situation, but if I saw another staff member essentially appropriating that language and trying to do that. And again there is that relational aspect that I see the intent, but then what's going to be the impact of that? But I think positionality-

Student 17: It's not exactly hierarchical either, but I wonder about some of the things I said that the students were saying like, "I'm a hip," Is one that I never heard until I got to Boston. There are some others that I personally don't feel comfortable with that I have less access to. I don't want to take that or I don't want to use that, but others sort of like meeting you where you are or saying this phrase really works and it's like, "Yes, I'm a hip." And it means six different things and it's all in how you say it.

Gretchen: I struggle with this a little bit because there are also times when I am authentically influenced by my student's language. You actually have to pay more attention not to do it because you're hearing it so much. This question-- actually I had it on for last week and I'm going to bring it back because we didn't do it, but this question of when the difference between appropriation and appreciation is a very interesting one to me. And also, particularly in the context of things like restorative justice, I feel like in white culture, which is a very over generalization, but there isn't

actually a lot of very good cultural strategy for healing and for addressing harm in ways that are not punitive.

So then there's this complication of, well, if we don't appropriate something we're repeating the harmful patterns. I assume they're not filming us because we're at the non-film table. [laughter] But then if we do, we're appropriating. So how do you borrow practices that are actually positive across communities in a way that doesn't appropriate them in a way that's disrespectful is a very interesting question.

Student 17: There's still reckoning that needs to be done.

Gretchen: A lot of reckoning.

Student 17: Yes.

Gretchen: Right? I don't think we've done any reckoning. Very little reckoning. So, but anyways. Sorry, I interrupted. I just think it's a hard question.

Student 16: But then I do think that it gets us back to the root of the relationship of what is the role of the adult because again some people are like, "I am there to be your friend," and then they'll be like, "I am going to take on that language." Other people, like me, again, I talk shit about this. My students told me they did not need that. They wanted more-- I don't really want to say more discipline, but those boundaries and having conversations with my students and them telling me that. But I think it just gets really difficult and I liked the article where the student was talking about-- I don't know if it was previous articles in the site. No, I don't want the thread, I want someone who's going to- [crosstalk]

[inaudible 01:05:20]

Gretchen: Well, it's interesting. I had a conversation recently and I can't remember if it was someone at HGSE and I'm trying to remember only because I don't want to 'out' someone, but I don't think it was. [laughs] But it was about, sort of, this notion that in Teach for America a lot of the white teachers will move into the neighborhood because that's what Teach for America tells you to do. And this person was like, "I didn't want to move into the-- I lived in that neighborhood my whole life. I'm not moving back into that neighborhood because I don't have to right now."

I think there's this thing about positionality in terms of- that we oversimplify the concept of cultural humility or cross-cultural communication and make it in these ways that are like, 'oh just move into the neighborhood and then somehow it will matter.' Or even this notion that we can assume what people in some area or from some group are going to want or need makes no sense on a relational level. But I feel like we do it because we're trying to teach- because it's a shorthand for what we're really saying, which is this thing that I feel like is what Duncan-Andrade captures really well. This week was the writer thing, right? Okay, good. And that chapter- it's about showing up for the collective before just yourself.

So there's something about being authentic, I think, but also sticking it out and not just giving up when it gets hard or moving when you have kids or all these things that are very classic things that people do when they can. That are the same things that I

would be looking for, or I do look for in my own friends. I look for people who are going to stay the course. If you're going to switch on me because you need something else or you don't have time, then I'm not going to-- I feel like it's human in this way and it gets oversimplified because we're trying to- I don't know, I'm not explaining it well.

I hear you and I feel like part of it is about really having authentic relationships, but also about as a human being committing to other human beings, whatever that means. It also means you have to decide that you're going to sacrifice things that might make your own life easier for the good of the collective, which is what we do when we love people.

Student 16: It also just reminds me a lot about what [unintelligible 01:07:55] process of interacting with if we were doing the majority of the work, the root, like a lot of the hard stuff that people don't want to do, would we need so much of this social justice education? It makes me think about, in a very blunt way, if white people were really doing a lot of this work in their communities at home, would we really need a lot of white people to come in urban areas and to do a lot of this work if we are starting [unintelligible 01:08:28] that's why I think it says that tention to be with not necessarily like I've had a problem with educators because I don't. It's just like, what are you doing? I just feel like we do this work from 8-3 and then it's like I feel good about myself, but then-

Gretchen: Sorry to cut folks off. There were a lot of things that came up in these conversations and I got pulled into one and then lost track of time, as is my way. But I want to just highlight a few things that Jess and I have added to this wall. So, there's definitely a theme that's coming up across groups around transparency and honesty, meaning that a part of authenticity is also being honest and transparent about your role and what your role is and how you're going to interact with young people.

In one group mandated reportings specifically came up and just this notion that because adults are mandated reporters in the context of working with youth, being really transparent about that and sort of being clear about when you are going to share information with other adults and when you're not is a really important part of trust-building.

Also, another theme that came up a lot is awareness of one's own identity and positionality. And thinking about the ways in which our own bodies and our own positionalities influence how young people read our interactions with them and the difference between intent and impact and really thinking about the way that positionality can influence impact, even if our intents are really in the right place or we think our intent is in the right place. So, that was an important one. And then I got pulled into this super interesting conversation which I'm not going to do a great job summarizing.

One of the things that came up in that conversation was this idea of false generosity. That sometime we have to be very careful of engaging in relationships with youth to make ourselves feel better versus to actually be an authentic relationship or in a community in a collective way. What does that mean about who we're working with and how we're working with folks? This the way in which that connects to Dunkin

Andrada his idea about the writers. So, we're going to move on, but we're going to keep these conversations going in. A lot of this is wrapped up in the tensions we're going to talk about at the end of class today.

If people could grab their clipboards, their handouts and a pen, we are going to do an activity called thinking on our feet. The way this activity works, is that I am going to have us do some interacting interactive thinking and talking with other folks. Again, as a meta point, we're going to have some people who are willing to be miked during each of these small interactive pieces. If you are in a group that is willing to be miked, you can make your way towards that center table, we will help you get miked for the moment. This is sort of concentric circles, in the sense that you're going to talk to a lot of different people over the course of 20 minutes, but it's just going to operate slightly differently.

It's not going to be that confusing. We're going to talk about four tensions of the work, we're going to talk about four things that have to do with our personalities and our own reflections in the work. Each time we're going to switch groups. The first thing I'm going to ask you to do, we are going to move. I would put the computers down so we don't knock them over. Make sure that you take a marker if you don't have a pen. The first thing I'm going to ask you to do is to quickly make a group of four people, where no two people are of the same height.

[background conversation]

Gretchen: Go, some people need to go over there to the corner too, go sit there. Stop where you are. I'm going to have this group move over there so, that you can talk to Doug and this group right here-- you've already had to do it. Well, this group right here will move to this center table. Arlin, you come over here, all right. We just need to be with a group. You can do it. Join any group.

Gretchen: So, this is the first thing I'd like you to think about. Often when working with youth in groups, there is a tension around connecting with individual youth and connecting with or helping to move the group as a whole.

I would like you to talk for a few minutes about how you think about the ways in which we as adults can connect with individual students while also holding together a community of students and what strategies you've used to do this. So, whoever you're near is fine turn and talk to the people you're near. I'm going to give you four minutes to talk and then we're going to move on to the next question. That's okay you can just clip on. If you're in a group of three, that's fine. It's not that big deal. So, how do we connect with individual youth while helping move the group or keeping the group as a whole together?

[background conversation] [laughter]

Student 18: I'm going to move over there.

Student 19: So, thinking about how do we connect with individual students, also with the group at the same time? I think some activities that I typically find myself doing or having students do like, individual reflections either written or verbally around different things. Learning how students not only like to be talked to and with right,

how they like people to interact with them and what that looks like. I think it's just interesting. I think it's like a collective activities, like a group activity.

It allows students to give their individual responses around how their interactions to look, how they like certain things to happen for them. That gives me a sense of the whole group is being engaged, but I'm learning something about each student on their own. I think that's really important. That's something that you can individualize too. When my students used to come into my classroom, I knew which students like hug, high five or a handshake. Have you guys done like that? So, you can tell how students like you to interact with them. I knew which students like hugs. Students like half didn't want to do anything at all. So, I would just be like-

Student 20: I saw this one video, this teacher who would have like a personalized like handshake for each student. [crosstalk]

Student 21: It was kind of what you're saying. By doing activities where a student is kind of leading it or like leading like you said, like lead in the group. You get to hear from that one student , but then you also get to hear about like how the other students are interacting with them, then that one student does have like the main, not spotlight at the moment that they're speaking the most, you can get to know them, but then they are calling other people into the conversation and that's like a good way of like, yeah. And everyone involved .

Student 20: Yeah. And then you kind of bring in mastery too, like your bringing in students feeling like they're owning like the topic.

One of my professors in college, when I was a freshman, she would have our class, a big class. She would schedule individual meetings with each of us like every point in the semester. So, we could first of all get to know each other. There'd be a checklist of all the things you wanted to know about us, which was a little systematic like here. She would gather information and she would then after that become more informal and we'd just kind of talk about life and all that stuff. At the end of it, everybody finished the class with a relationship with her.

There were a lot of community building things in the class too, just having that separated kind of connection where you get to know each other a little better in ways that might not have been possible in like a 3 hour class, was really cool. It's just like making time outside of class too, a lot of those students that we heard about before were talking about going up to those teachers and talking individually and that's what those were those big moments for them where they were like, oh I really connected. So, maybe it has to do with inside the class and outside of the class too cause you can't really do everything at once perfectly okay.

Student 19: I think it's awesome too. Like switching up how you interact with the class, does something good. Then you learn that was with students prefer. Like I've done typically, teachers do cold calling. Students don't prefer that method, right? Thinking about like popcorn, where students have an opportunity to just call out answers. You tend to notice which students feel less likely to respond or when students are more likely to respond even if you do like so not even like the popcorn, but I think about, have you ever had like, after I finished I get to call on somebody else?

Student 20: Yeah.

Student 19: So, I do that. The student get to call on somebody else or just like everybody says something and I think that gives you a sense of not only how people work individually, but how they work in groups and how they prefer to be in groups. I think that says a lot about people's personality too. But I don't know, I think sometimes it's just a matter of taking time to just get to know students. Like, if it's your lunch, if you notice the student is not having a good day, right? Hey, you know what I'm saying? Do you want to stop in and chat really quickly and talk about the day, right? It's just like asking students doing check ins. I think it's so important. What happened over the weekend, right?

Before spring break, anybody have plans, they come back. What'd you guys do? Ask students about what's happening outside, even if it's just in the morning after school or at lunch, it's super important.

Gretchen: I'm not going to have you move 'cause it'll be easier to stay for 2 times and then we'll move. I'm now going to switch you to a reflection question. I'm going to ask you to talk for a minute in the group you're in about whether or not you are more comfortable working with groups of youth or individual youth? If you said groups, what size groups? Then if folks can talk about why you think this is the case, what makes you more comfortable working with individuals or with groups and what makes you uncomfortable about the opposite? I'm going to give you 3 or 4 minutes and then we'll switch groups. Go ahead.

[laughter]

Student 21: I kind of like groups, right? Like, smallish groups. That's just because of the fact that I like groups, but also I feel individuals are kind of easier because I don't like when you're speaking in a group, sometimes people like [inaudible], those will drift off and stuff and to feel like everyone's getting a good amount of attention. It's not possible to give every single person-- Same about one, there's normally one person dominating the group, right? Well, like speaking a lot and stuff and you're like, you want to give that person the airtime, then I also want to call everybody else if I didn't want to ignore this one person.

I feel individuals are kind of easier or small groups just because I thought everyone-- deserves to have the same attention the same air time and that's not always going to happen in massive groups, so that's another thing.

Student 20: Yes, I think I'm most comfortable with medium-sized groups, but because we're too big, that's what happens. If it's individuals-- I don't know, maybe it's the age. I'm working with mainly middle schoolers, so it's really hard to get to connect to them one-on-one if you're just starting that relationship. That's a big struggle, but if you have a group, it's almost easier because they communicate through play and joking and I can do that all day. If it's just Fiona and I'm like, "Hello, how are you doing?" We're not going to connect the same way. Maybe that says more about me than it does about them, you know what I'm saying?

Student 19: That is interesting though. I think people in general, but particularly young people when you put them together, entertain themselves.

[laughter]

Student 19: All you have to do is just [crosstalk] [unintelligible 01:21:01] . Let's have fun.

Student 20: You're just making sure that they're not getting hurt.

[laughter]

Student 21: Yes, it's energy. You can see a switch. A youth student should have been coming in and just be like, "Hi, how are you?" When their friends come in [crosstalk] .

Student 19: They're like, "Eyyy."

[laughter]

Student 19: I think it's difficult to manage large groups in general like young people or adults, but I love the energy of a large group of young people. I think about whenever we have assemblies, I think about whenever we have different whole school events, working with young people in that instance. Just the amount of energy that they have, they can fill the room because they feed off each other. They're like contestant seem like-- so that's super, probably like talent shows or someone they cranked up, everybody was like, "Eyyy, eyyy or I like in this." They don't like-- That's something that I appreciate.

I think that that's powerful. As much as I can't get off as many young people together as possible, I try to do that. I think with the piece around, probably individual or relationship-building, obviously it's more-- small groups are working individually.

Student 20: I think again it's both. You need both to feel a real connection with someone because even if you meet someone just by themselves, I feel I don't really create that trust and that bond unless I see you in your element. I'm like, "Okay."

Student 21: A lot of person's personality depends on their interest with other people.

Student 20: Yes, their circle, yes.

Student 21: You can't see someone's whole personality until you see them interact [crosstalk] .

Student 19: Well, you mean opposite-- Even for me, I'm typically like, "Ooh," when I'm with my-- my friends like a small group, but in large group sometimes I'm like,-

Student 21: Yes, exactly, exactly.

[laughter]

Student 21: -"Why aren't you doing?" and so-

[laughter]

Student 19: -thinking about how that maybe a good environment for a lot of young people. Some young people are like, "This is-- I'm out."

Student 21: That doesn't show that just because they're not saying, it doesn't mean that they're shy or they don't like to talk It's just the fact that they're in a large group a lot, maybe I just step back. [laughs]

Student 19: Yes, that's true. That sounds-- yes.

Student 21: Yes, it's true, a mix is good, but yes.

Student 19: Interesting. I think we've been answering this like for what we prefer, but I wonder if it's interesting-- How young people feel, young people prefer larger group. We will be more inclined to work with young people in larger groups and then-

Student 20: Yes, I just remembered summer camp, we'd have those huge group they were my favorites.

Student 22: I don't think it's either or, which I'm not answering the question, but I think it just really depends on the situation. I really liked what you said about you're not going to have the same relationship with the students. It's going to be different depending on their specific needs. I'm really comfortable about both. I mean I think we all have to be to lead the classroom.

Student 23: I think this might be also a really obvious thing to say, but it also for me depends on the size of the group. I feel like small group working individual work, feel really natural. I think a challenge that I continue to push myself on is how do I build really authentic meaningful long-lasting, to your point, community with like 30 kids in a class where all 30 kids are equally invested in each other and the system in the community. Not just as a "we care about you" each other's academic success, but "I got you "outside of this room. Even in classes here, the bigger the class rate right the harder it can be to really feel like you're known and seen as a member, so it's how do you make people feel really seen when there are that many humans in a physical space.

Student 24: I think that there's benefit, too to having the opportunity to work with the same young person in different contexts. Working with them individually, working with them in a small group setting, working with them in a larger group setting because then you have more opportunity to observe them in those different contexts and coach them accordingly. Maybe you notice that they have a lot of really great things to say one-on-one and that disappears when they're in a larger group. That would be an opportunity to coach that student, to step up and speak out. Maybe they just don't feel confident in what they're saying, and they just need reassurance, and that's an opportunity for personal growth.

Student 23: I also think, too the task at hand I know as far as going back to the really-- I've like 30-plus students, especially as a first-year teacher, classroom management and talking to a lot of new teachers, that's a big one.

Student 25: I just read the question so I'm still--

Student 22: Yes, I think the words coming to mind as I think about this is consistency. Consistency is like the death knell for a lot of first-year teachers because they start out really like, "I care. I'm going to do all these great things," But then because they're not consistent, with just like basic things in a room. Kids don't trust them. These are like well, but what you said yesterday was different on what you said today, so how do you build someone's capacity to be a strong educator without sacrificing their ability to have relationships with the young people. Is that a a system thing or human-- Is that coachable, is that just like a flaw in the system?

Student 23: What's difficult about that is do you notice yourself changing things based upon the student's need? I find myself doing that and then that causes tension with the whole group because it's like, "Whoa, why did you allow that person to do that?" Again, if we're going on for this philosophy of meeting students where they're at, but then that completely changes those structures and that community culture that you built at the beginning of the school year. I also feel like maybe sometimes that inconsistency sometimes is necessary to meet the student's where they're at, but then I don't know, I feel there's tensions with that.

Gretchen: All right, so I'm going to ask you to move. This time I've counted more carefully. I'm going to ask you to form a group of three. We should be able to form groups of three where no two people are from the same state/country. If you're not from the United States, you get to go with your country. If you are from the United States, go with your state, okay, but no two people can be from the same state. However you're thinking about it, okay? Form a new group of three. Go, move around. Talk to each other.

Students: Michigan. Florida. China. California.

Gretchen: [laughs] You can do it in either way. [laughs] How much responsibility do you think the adult facilitator has in terms of ensuring safety or facilitating agency? To what extent is the adult responsible for ensuring safety? To what extent is the adult responsible for making sure that the youth have agency? How might you think about being an adult in a situation where young people are engaged in making a decision about something that could get them in trouble in some way. I'm going to give you four minutes to think about that as a group and then we'll switch to our reflection. Go ahead, teenagers.

Student 26: Feels so awkward, okay. [laughs] I struggle with this hardcore because I'm in the youth organizing field and I think about this all the time. Where I'm at right now is-- Well, I'm just being transparent about what the risks are, but then there's how much of that do you do that it doesn't scare them away from the kind of work that needs to be done. Just really having them think through the risks of different actions, think through what might be at stake for themselves in a way that really-- allows them to consider their own agency in their decision-making. I think youths do incredible activism and they know what the stakes are, so providing that space for them.

Student 27: One of the tensions that I would layer on or expectation. What's our responsibility to inform families or involve families in the discussion?

Gretchen: I struggle with that.

Student 27: It's one thing to have the conversation with the youth and-- I don't know, what's our responsibility as the person responsible for minors in letting them feels like not the right thing, but not stopping something that could get them into some serious trouble without the consent of their families, I dont know.

Gretchen: This is something I really struggle with because I find it much easier to work with adolescents than parents. I'm much more uncomfortable with working with parents. It's getting better now that I'm a parent, but not that much better.

[laughter]

I'm not saying this in the sense that I've done it well, but I feel like among the work that I've seen, the people who do it really well are working cross generationally, so they have families in some way with the exception maybe of the queer community where families aren't always in favor of the stuff, but if possible, they have families on board and supporting their kids in some way. I don't know what you do when the families disagree. At some point, I think kids have to make their own decisions, but in a lot of these situations, I see adults who are really good at bringing parents in in a way that then helps with this kind of question, I think.

Student 28: In my community, the art teacher, right after the elections, she let the students do this big project and part of it was they made, we discovered that projects are also spoken in this building and downtown of Slante and so we did this silent piece march which took a lot of organizing. I was part of the organizing committee for it because my organization also participated. We had a whole bunch of younger kids and their families come . We wanted to make sure that the younger kids and all the families that were going to come would be protected, the high school students we wanted to protect them too, but we also wanted to make sure that it was going to be an all-city event.

We ended up getting the current and the former mayor involved in all kinds of stuff because we did a lot of outreach to those communities and we were lucky that we have a really progressive community that we could do that in. We did want to make sure that we did it all legally and above board so that there would be no problems with the police because more of what we were worried about is whether there would be some tension with the police.

Gretchen: It makes me think about something- it's okay, I think just realized I have in me.

Student 27: You do?

Gretchen: It makes me think about something we talked about a few weeks ago which is just the ways in which sometimes our voices are most powerful dealing with other adults, so what can we do to get out front to figure out how to get other adults ready for whatever young people are deciding they're going to do. There are some situations where I think like this one maybe, "That is actually enough. Then there's other ones like DACA where it's not enough.

Student 26: What happens when families aren't on board, youth make a decision against those wishes or they get in trouble or whatever then where do we stand?

Then are we advocates for them and the decisions that they made through their own agency regardless of how we feel about what that decision is and what does that look like too?

Student 28: Yes, that was something that I was going to touch on because I feel like in that situation, you have to make your decision of like you need to keep a good relationship with families and parents because they have such a huge impact on what do you do, but then at the same time, you've got to keep good relationship with the youth and basically advocate and if you've advised or encouraged this, you can't just sell out on them and be like, "This is what happens." It's a really sticky position to be in because like, "Which way do I actually go about this?"

Gretchen: Right. I think that you can't do the sellout then, right?

Student 28: Yes.

Gretchen: At a certain point, it's like, "Well then, you have to stand with them." That goes back to the writer thing like what does it mean to stand then after the thing comes down?

Student 27: Even if you don't agree?

Gretchen: Yes.

Student 26: The way I think you can achieve this is-

Student 27: Yes, it's even harder.

Even harder where you ended up making a choice that I maybe don't agree with and I do agree with your ability to make that choice that you made.

Gretchen: Yes, it's such a hard thing.

Okay. Finish up your sentence.

Student 27: Strategies, I don't know.

Student 26: She said that. She said there was a strategy of getting that ahead to people [unintelligible 01:34:31] strategy and make [unintelligible 01:34:33] strategies?

Gretchen: Three, two, one. You're not switching groups, so if you're really compelled by what you're talking about, you can just keep talking about it for the next question. I'm going to ask you to now again reflect inward and this time, I'm going to ask you to think or talk about a time when you have had trouble stepping up. In other words, a time when you think you should have used your power as an adult, but you didn't and then if you're willing to talk about what worried you in that moment. If you're at a table that's being filmed and you don't want to share, that's totally fine, but again, talk about time when you had trouble using your power, but you wish you had or you think you should have and what was going on for you in that moment. Go ahead.

Student 27: We're not moving?

Student 26: No, we not moving.

Student 27: You're going to-

Student 25: Yes.

Student 26: In that same piece march, I was in a position at my job at the time where I could have done more. I reached for the younger kids and their families to come from more parts of the community than ended up coming, but because my job was in danger already, I didn't invite all those people as actively as I would have otherwise because part of it was also the school calendar. I hadn't seen the kids yet because we hadn't been back in school, but I could have contacted the principals and have them send it out and I didn't or the communications person in their district.

Because I was doing this kind of ex officio not as my role because my job was in danger, I didn't do that and I feel a little bit bad that there was-- We did have 400 people or 500 people at the event, but we could have had like 1,000 and that would have been great.

Student 28: Over the past three years before I came here, I was part-time working at my old secondary school and it goes to this stage where people applying to the universities and stuff and they have a group of kids who are like these are the star kids, they get to apply to these universities and everyone else was ignored. There was a kid that came to me and I was supposed to come back and to help the people, the star kids with their applications to make it flawless and there was a kid that came to me and he was like, "I really need your help. I'm not getting any attention in school- not any attention, but I'm not getting as much work as everyone else."

At that stage, I had to make a decision that these are the people that I've been assigned to help and I'm getting paid to work with this, but this kid is a person who actually needs my help. With that one, at the beginning of the time I was working there, I was just like, "Well, these are the people I've been asked to work with. I can't really. First of all, I'm here for this amount of time and all." That's the one time that I had the power to obviously help someone who genuinely needed it, but because of, I guess it's that level hierarchy thing where it's like, "Because my manager or my boss was like, "This is what you ought to be working with, this is what we need to have." Because I didn't use my power in that way.

I guess the only thing that worried me was just the fact that the idea that I'm not at the top. I'm here, these people see me as the person that's come to help, but I'm doing what I'm being told to do. It's that grappling there. Then after that, I was like, "This isn't right." You get to the point where you're like, "These people are going to do well regardless of mine. I can help them, but they're going to do well." They were using extra time and time that I actually wanted to use to help other people, but that was it.

Student 25: Mine is actually similar to that. I was an English teaching assistant in Malaysia and they do really obvious tracking there. Their brightest kids are group A and their kids who are tracked the lowest are group E. They make it really obvious.

They have like, "Oh, this group is called it's E for efficient" But it's obvious what these demarcations mean. Then the kids in group E were typical rowdy kids. They had no interest in learning English. For me, it was really difficult teaching, I'm not going to lie, but at the same time, I felt like the teachers would, it was just culturally accepted that they would really neglect them. As a cultural outsider, I really struggled with how I should be like, "No, don't have me teach these smart kids who speak amazing English and probably speak better English than I do.

How can we better support these kids who are constantly neglected?" My main thing was like, "Is it even my place?" They would shave their heads because their haircuts, they didn't have the right haircut and they would do a lot of-- they would still use corporal punishment and that was also-- yes, it was-

Student 27: [unintelligible 01:39:52]

Student 25: Yes, exactly. They would wrap their knuckles if they were being-- and they would menacingly

Use a cane and it-- Yes, exactly but what could I have done?

Student 26: Yes, it's hard when you're dealing with a systemic thing like that. I did-- That made me think of this other story, when I taught English in Spain, I was also an assistant, technically, although I ran my own classroom. There were Fulbright students doing the same program but I wasn't doing the Fulbright program. There was this family that was really active on the PTO, was really, really nice, a younger kid and an older kid.

One day the older kid who is in fourth grade comes up to the teacher after a test, you know how kids give like a heart shape if they finish early they draw a heart or a star whatever. Well, she drew a swastika. I wasn't in the room because I would have flipped out because I'm half Jewish, and I said, "You have to tell her what that means." They said, "That's the family's thing," and I said, "Okay, I'm here, I have to be flexible, but you should tell them that I'm Jewish at least, so they have somebody to connect to this story." They wouldn't even let me do that.

Later on, in the year, her little brother drew swastikas as a decoration on an art project and then everybody in the whole class started drawing them because he was the best artist in the class. Then I was like, "No, you really have to say something now." I think at that point they did, but it was already out in the world. I don't think that they told the family that I was Jewish or my feelings about it, but I let them be the ones in power partly because of my role although they couldn't have fired me because I was there as a grant and what were they going to do.

It was very uncomfortable and I worry about them now because in Spain there's a lot of things have come out since 2000 and this was before 2007. Since 2007 there have been a lot of things that have come out and tensions between the old Spanish Falange and some of the nationalist movements and things have gotten violent a few times, between the people who are more Socialist and those who were former fascists its all thinly veiled with new political parties in the constitution and everything.

Gretchen: I'm going to shift because you all have to deal with this.

Student 29: Thanks so much.

Gretchen: I'll start and then if someone else wants to they can. This happened to me recently where-- It has happened to me a lot as a teacher where I've been trying to make decisions about cost benefit analysis. So, "Is this the moment when I want to risk a relationship with another adult basically over X?" But it hadn't happened to me as a researcher until recently. Recently something happens where I really felt like the school had done something that was wrong and I had to make a decision about whether or not I was going to use my voice, use my positionality as the Harvard person to actually try to do something about it.

It was a really hard moment of like, "if I do this I could be giving up the potential to do this work ever again, but if I don't do it what is the message that that sends to the young person who is affected by the decision that was being made?" That was one that happened to me recently. I did do it but I did it in maybe not as forcefully as I should have and I'm still wondering about whether I should have-- I did it in a very "I want to partner with you" district, not like "district". I don't know if that was the right decision, because I'm not sure anything will come of what I did.

Kirsten: It wasn't enough?

Gretchen: Yes. I don't know if other people have had any similar experiences or any other kinds of things.

Carlyn: I ran a creative arts program in Guatemala for a couple of years and had a really hard time with the administration pushing for Arts as an important part of development and learning. There were some high school students that were coming out as gay and the administration's response was very much along the lines of "we can save you, you'll be okay."

I was not out at work in my job and that was something that in that moment I tried to be as supportive individually to each student, but didn't bring my own identity into it because I think I knew at the time that if my identity was brought into that, that it was going to completely tank my ability to push this program forward. That's something that's stuck with me for a very long time. Did I do enough to support those young people? I'm 31 years old and coming here to Harvard is the first time that I've had teachers who are openly out in the classroom.

Gretchen: Living in the bubble. Anyone else? Chase?

Chase: I think it's interesting to me that I can't necessarily pinpoint one, but this comment from you, Carlyn, about risk and safety-- And I don't want this to sound white male tears but it just might.

[laughter]

We also should think about the ways that classrooms can be harmful to teachers.

Gretchen: Yes, totally.

Chase: I'm still processing shit that went on 15 years ago in my classroom and that's not good for my kids and it's not good for me. I'm still wrestling with norms of what it means to be a man, what it means to be a human being, what it means to show emotion, how we show emotions because sometimes class feels like a place where I'm caught up in all this stuff. Then I can't teach or I'm so focused on interactions with my male students and I'm completely ignoring the girls in my class, or it's a lot easier for me to connect with the girls and so then there's a divide between me and the boys.

It brings back that first question about power, sometimes I want to pass the button to my bosses. I wish the administration would be thinking about this. You said, telling your students "I can't actually talk about what that meeting was about." We had so many times-- We had times in my school where a kid would get a consequence but it's not like I needed to know the consequence but it was that it happened.

We actually we cannot talk about it with staff, right? It's just like I want some confirmation of that. Teachers need mental health services and need space to process their lives and experiences and then there's a barrier, personal life and school, unless it's managed really well by people who might be more secure than I am, or who have done more reckoning with that than I have. I don't want to bring my shit to the classroom.

Gretchen: Also, there is something about-- I think you're raising up something that I struggle with and I don't know that I end up where other adults think I should. I also don't know if I'm right but which is like to what extent do we show young people ,that ,as a way of modeling, this is it what it is. Being an adult is traumatic too in lots of ways. We are dealing with the same administration and when it is us showing that, asking them to take care of us in a way that becomes unfair and I really struggle with that. To be authentic, you guys know me, I share, but then what does that mean about what I'm asking for from people? I don't know what the answer to that is.

Kirsten: When is it okay to admit that you actually don't know to a young person?

Gretchen: I do that too.

Kirsten: I don't know but then how do you maintain-- I don't know, it feels like a delicate balance of how often do you admit not knowing or is it like blame it on someone else, or give yourself an outlet-- All of those questions.

Gretchen: I will say just like as far as HGSE goes, it's amazing how much of a difference it's been to have a Dean who's willing to be transparent. It makes it so much easier and is willing to say when he can't, right? It's a way easier on me as a faculty member. I think that goes to your point too, Chase, about just-- yes, it means to cut across the system. Or to have an administration who's willing to accept you as your identity so that then when it comes time for the kids to need support it's okay for you to get it. Okay, finish up your sentence.

[background noise]

Kirsten: Thanks for sharing. You too, Chase.

[background noise]

Kirsten: You have to think about your job.

Student 31: You can be fired in over a half-- the states.

Gretchen: Three, two, one. Okay we're going to stop. We're going to stop. I'm going to ask you to switch groups once more and this time to form a group of three-ish or four where no two people are the same age. Go ahead, see if you can do it and no two people of the same age and this means that the people who have the mics can move if they want.

[background conversation]

You guys have not had to deal with the mics yet. Do you mind going to the mic table?

Student 32: Sure.

Student 33: Yes.

Gretchen: Let's mix it up. Let's mix it up.

Student 32: What are we finding here?

Gretchen: Just get in a group, it doesn't matter. You could go to Desa's group if you want. He needs someone. All right, three, two, I'm going to bring you out, one, zero. Great. In this group, I would like you to think about this tension. Is our role to scaffold strategically so that students learn, or do what we hope, or expect they will, or is our goal the opposite, to remain open such that students can decide the direction and outcomes of a project?

If we stick to a particular balance of stepping up and stepping back and truly share power with students, is it okay for the group to fail? This is a question about how we think about our own voice and power in relationships with students when it comes to the balance between flexibility or being productive. To what extent do we use our power and our relationships with youth to guide them towards the end that we're hoping for, and to what extent do we use our power and our relationships to hold space, that we let them make decisions about?

Turn inward, and I'm going to give you about four minutes to discuss this question.

[background conversation]

Student 34: Thank you.

Kirsten: There's no escape.

[laughter]

I go mic table in the hand top mic. Let's go. Is our role to scaffold strategically so that students learn? This is a hard one.

Student 35: I think it is our role. I think it is our role as educators to switch more from the authoritarian-disciplinarian type of educator to more of a facilitator, especially depending on their role. I think if they do fail, then that's okay as long as they were empowered. I think, ultimately, it may not seem like it at the moment, but as they grow older, and they develop, they're going to get more out of that. They're going to learn more-

Kirsten: At having failed.

Student 35: - at having failed and to switch that to face adverse situation, I think as opposed to saying, "Great. Everything's great. Move on." If that makes sense.

Student 36: That makes sense. I think that when a group of young people that are facilitator, or led by an adult fail, it's shocking, because we live in an educational system, in general, that doesn't accept failure and the failure is like, "You can't move forward." It's not so much of a learning experience. It's just like a defining mark in your life.

It might definitely be a shock for young people I can imagine where they're like, "What? You're an adult. You're a teacher. You know what you're doing. How could this happen?"

It could be also a powerful power shift where if it hasn't been drilled in yet that the power dynamic is much more different in those spaces in a traditional classroom, then that could be a defining moment where people are like, "Actually, we do have agency in this to do whatever we want with it." It's not that at the end of the day the adult in the room is going to be like, "Guys, to actually get this done, we have to scrap everything and do it my way."

Student 37: I actually, think it's interesting. I've seen a lot of either-or in these, and I don't think that's the case. Also, is this truly failure? Why are we even labeling it that way? [chuckles] Especially if this is a process and relationships are being formed that haven't even been allowed to occur in these spaces, so I don't think we should-- I personally, I'm even doing a YPAR project now with my students.

We might not get to what we initially planned, but we've gone through this process so there's that, "Is that a failure?" Then I think being really intentional again about the beginning of setting goals with students and then having them reflect, and really encouraging and think about, we've gone through this process together and that should not be seen as a failure.

Kirsten: I think I really agree with that. I was going to say something very similar. I think it's less about failure and more about openness to mistake-making, and that when you set a goal, you might not reach that exact goal, but you'll get somewhere and creating openness to that. Then I also think something I was talking about with the group a few questions ago, was the culture of grades and how we evaluate students in learning environments in general.

I think that it's really hard to say that failure is okay when you have a culture of evaluation based on success or failure with an either-or dichotomy. I think part of saying, "My classroom's different" is saying you can get an A even if the project

doesn't work, and there is success within "failure" that you can still be successful in your learning, and you can get an A and whatever feels like a win for you as a student because of the way our school works at large, systemically, can happen alongside learning from a failure in my classroom, which is hard.

Student 35: I really like that because I think there's so much emphasis on like you said, on the failure. I think especially for me, if there's a lot of undue stress that we put on our students, just be like, "Either you fail or you pass." If you don't fail-- then you're like competing with your peers and it's like you're losing sight of what you're trying to do to begin with, what do you want them to learn out of this particular project or initiative? I really appreciate that because I didn't think about that.

Student 37: Something that's not related to a YPAR project, but what I've done with my students is, even during high stakes standardized testing, I've actually have students reflect about their grade and how I seem like what Gretchen trying to do with allowing us to have more voice is like, "Here's your grade on one hand. How are we going to improve that to fit within this system? On the other hand, what would be a personal goal or a personal grade that you would have given yourself?" I felt that's really powerful because it's a way to talk about this really messed up systemic way. We might not be able to change it, but then you could at least have a say.

Kirsten: It's so top down. It's like as long as colleges still are asking for GPA like and we want to make our kids college-ready, we can't not-- How do we--? Exactly, because that puts them behind broadly. How do we meet ourselves in the middle and create both? Which is cool that you do that. That's awesome.

Student 38: Let me just read again. Sorry.

Student 39: I think it depends on the project like what your actual project is, what you're actually doing.

Student 40: For me, this applies directly to and literally within the last 12 hours of my project which was last night. I met with my group and said, "Are we ready to think about revamping the handbook of your club for next year so that the new group coming in can have a better start?" and they're like, "No, we're so tired. This group is over." I was like, "Whoa." They were on fire of complaining about just having it be done. I'm mentally trying to shift gears, think about directing them towards something.

One particular student, she was perseverating on, "The club is over. It's done. It's done. It needs to change." I'm like, "I hear that you're saying that the club is over as it exists now. Is there a way that we can talk about what changes need to be made in the future for the next group of people? Forget the handbook. Let's put that on the side. Let's talk about how it needs to change, and then just try and to repeat that and reiterate that, and get them to come up with the things that need to be done."

They were drafting and writing this letter to the university, to their club adviser and I was like, "Whoa." They were doing it, but I was like trying to gear them towards having a productive message, and a productive letter, and constructive feedback as opposed to, "This is awful. This sucks. This didn't work." How about, "This is what we find needs to change. This is where we need to go. This is what we hope to see." I

was like, if they didn't do that, I don't know if the university would listen to them, honestly.

Eli: I think failure is important. It's how you then reflect on failure. I don't know that these two questions for us as they are framed are mutually exclusive. I do think it's our goal to scaffold strategically, but I think that students can still be in control with adult allies scaffolding strategically.

I think that if that then means that your campaign or your project or whatever it is fails, then you have to scaffold in such a way where you can talk about failure and say to the students all long, "I want to be real with you that if we do this this way, there's some chance this is going to fail, and then we're going to have to talk." I think about this a lot in terms of having been a youth organizer and now being an adult ally to young people who do organizing.

I think sometimes I'm in conversations with young people who are like, "Tomorrow we want to end racism", and I'm like, "That's great, so that's not going to happen. But we can run this really ambitious campaign as long as you know-- Yes, great, let's do it and see what happens, and then when this maybe-too-ambitious campaign fails we can learn from that and talk about why it failed, and what are some organizing strategies that we can use in the--" That's okay, because if the main goal is political education and getting better at organizing I think that's-- I don't know.

Student 38: Right. I agree, I think it's a combination of both, and I think that the adult role as facilitator is a really important role and it wouldn't be necessarily as successful a project without the really healthy balanced of youth-led initiative with some adult facilitation. At least in my experience, that seems to be that way, but pulling in a lot of the things we've been talking about, trust, honesty, and care and love and the things that make that relationship work.

Eli: Yes, and I think that if young people trust you enough and you're transparent enough with them, failure as it's traditionally defined may not feel like failure, too, right? I think it will feel really different than if you're just don't have a relationship with an adult and you're--

Student 39: One that's part of why I said it depends on the project, because I feel like as you said if the goal of the project is political awareness and the ability to have skills for organizing more and do better or whatever, figuring out ways to scaffold the pieces of it, even if the whole project, even if you don't end up having whatever action your goal was, then there's still been a lot of concrete knowledge that's been gained and there's a lot of things that people can learn from in that.

Student 40: I sort of wrestle with that though, because thinking about this particular group of youth, they don't have the same frame of mind with ones that I have, you've done so much, you learned so much from this. They're thinking "I don't really care about what I've learned. This one thing I wanted didn't happen." So, it's like having that come back to "is it this only this one thing that you went in for, or did you go in to be a part of a collective whole to make changes?" Because you have made changes, it just wasn't this one change that you wanted to happen.

Eli: Yes, and how do you orchestrate that shift too? From being 'you came in for this one thing, but there are all these other--

Student 40: There's 10 things that happened, this one didn't.

Eli: Yes, and I feel like young people I work with are often similarly, they're just like "I want to do this one thing. Everything sucks." And, I'm like "I get it, but."

Gretchen: I'm going to add this one question, which is, this time the opposite. To talk about a time when you've had trouble stepping back. In other words, a time when you think you should've remained silent but didn't, so you used your power but wish you hadn't in some way in work with young people. What were you worried about that made it hard to remain silent? And then if you can't think about a time when stepping back was hard, try thinking about why that might be the case, right, for you. Why is it that you might not have trouble with that or that you might often step back? Okay, go ahead and turn inward, we're going to have about three or four minutes and then we'll go on to the next question. Again thank you. Thank you so much.

[background conversation]

Student 36: Well, it's actually in my YPAR placement now, at Boston Newcomers Academy. They are writing their proposals and they had to come to college classes and do observations but in pairs, and there was this one guy and girl that were paired up and she's like "oh, we should just split up and do both of our observations in different classrooms at the same hours, then we spend half the time, and then we're back.

Then we just come back, and we're done real fast." The guy was disagreeing, and they were just getting into an argument about it, they're like, "Miss, what do you think?" And, I was like "I don't know, usually we go in pairs because one person takes notes and the other one listens around." Then she wasn't happy with that, and then the teacher came in and I noticed how her approach was completely different.

Gretchen: What was it?

Student 36: Kristen. She just listened, and repeated back what she heard, and then they made up their own position. So, I just gave my opinion, straight up. I just brought the power. I was like "this is what I do, this is what works for me and what I think is right in these situations." But, Kristen just listened and she's like "yes, it sounds like you waste less time in doing it this way, but the other way could be more comprehensive and they just made their own--

Kirsten: It's just factual.

Student 36: They were just-- I don't know what they decided in the end. I don't think they resolved it at that moment, but they were just still fighting over it.

Gretchen: That's interesting.

Student 36: I don't know. It was interesting, because I definitely wanted to teach her, but I completely forgot, it was like a YPAR thing at that moment, so I was getting asked for an answer.

Gretchen: That happens to me a lot.

Kirsten: I had a recent-- not in a YPAR space specifically, but I'm working with high schoolers on internship placements for this summer, and it's really hard for me to take a step back when they are quiet in groups and less silence, sort of sit in a group situation. We were at a pre-readiness boot camp doing an activity about-- called "who would you hire?" They were reading a sample resume and reading a Facebook profile and talking about what they saw to pick someone for this hypothetical role, and they were literally just silent for 5 minutes and I just had to say something. [chuckles]

I couldn't let them take the time they needed, which I immediately knew was problematic, but it was - I mean it was like my -- I was like "so, what are we thinking? I'm thinking this, what are you guys thinking? What do you notice? Here are some things that I noticed. Did you guys notice those too?" Rather than let them know, sort of get there and the **[inaudible 02:06:11]** resume, so this is a really easy activity for me which I also know. And I knew that wasn't the case for that, but I couldn't-- and I couldn't stop. I don't even know, it was like out of body.

Student 36: I feel like you go to automatic--

Kirsten: Yes, like automatic grown-up mode

Student 37: This is really difficult for me to answer, which is making me think about 'why'.

[crosstalk]

Or maybe not, I don't know. But, then I'm like-- yes, so I'm thinking about that and how I do try to be strategic about when I **[inaudible 02:06:53]** because especially where you should have remained silent. Yes, something about that.

Student 35: I was thinking about one time when I was-- it wasn't necessarily with the youth, it was when I was an instructor in the military. I had a student that they wanted to fail, and I was like no, he's fine he just needs some more guidance and they wanted to fail him. I ended up going all the way through-- I put a really good chunk of my career on the line, because I was like "I'm not signing this report."

I had to co-sign it, and then "if you want to fail him, then I'm not signing it." You know what I mean? It's all went up to the chain of command and finally he would appeal and was like "I don't care anyway." So, I felt like-- It was frustrating because he was like "I don't give a shit." And, I was like "man, I spent like months writing these proposals and going to bat for you -

Kirsten: Advocating.

Student 35: Yes, and he was like "I don't care." So I wish I was like - I've learned to pick my battle but in hindsight, it's just how I am, once I get in, and sometimes I'm just going to be-- But then it did bother me that was just like "whatever, I don't care." And, he's still in the military and I'm not.

Gretchen: So, one interesting thing about that thought is like, did he really not care or did it mean something that you did that, right? It's hard to know sometimes. Yes.

Student 35: It's hard to know. But, I was like-- they were like, "we already made our decision, but you're the main one. You have to sign off on it." And, I'm like, "No. You sign it. Yes you sign it." They're like, "no, no, or you're affected by it." And I was like "well, then I'm affected by it." I was just very-- so it just bothered me that they were going to use their power of influence.

Gretchen: That's frustrating.

Student 35: I know in military [inaudible 02:08:36] animal, but I think that happens a lot in [inaudible 02:08:40] they're like "we're making our decision, whether or not you sign it."

Kirsten: Yes, like an administrator, it's like the student's being expelled, you're their primary teacher.

Student 35: Yes, but without talking to you.

Kirsten: You win. Yes.

Gretchen: I just had a case like that yesterday, where someone was talking about refusing to sign something like that.

Student 35: Because it's really messed up. They want you to do the dirty work, even though-- and you'd be the bad person, and you're like the one -

Kirsten: It's like you made the call.

Student 35: Yes, exactly. But, then you're like - you're career could be on the line or your reputation.

Student 38: I actually have students especially at the beginning of that relationship with them and just letting the silence feel okay, and it usually leads to something really insightful, but I tend to jump in too soon I think.

Student 40: I'm thinking about a specific instance where a really traumatic event took place in the community, and I was in my homeroom, it's called community meeting in our school, and I was bringing up the opportunity for people to talk or to discuss if they had things they wanted to share, or questions they wanted to ask. I was bringing up that opportunity, and this one student just got up and walked out of the room and the two other teachers in this class kept facilitating that conversation and I stepped out with the student. I said, "are you okay?"

She's like, " I'm tired of talking about this. I just want to move on. I'm tired of talking about it." It was this really jarring awful moment where in some ways, I really wanted to talk about it. I was glad for this conversation to happen and I didn't think about that student not wanting to talk about it anymore, needing space, needing to separate and needing to move on. I felt really bad that I triggered her in that way. I think about that a lot when I think about needing to step back.

Eli: That's hard too because there are probably other students that really needed that conversation. If you hadn't had that conversation there's probably some students who would be like, "I wanted to talk--" It's a lose-lose situation.

Student 40: I don't--I didn't want to not have the conversation for those students. It's gaining the whole and sacrificing the one. That one is still so important to the whole. That is why it was this awful tension. It still exists for me when I try to do that.

Student 39: How possible would it be if something like that comes up again in your context to offer an opportunity for students who want to not talk about it to leave the room, then how would you be able-- How would we as educators or teachers in a situation like that be able to facilitate that? Is it--Because sometimes when a situation like that happens you feel you have to stay in the room because you want to be able to support your peers.

At the same time-- Or you feel you should maintain some of their solidarity. How can we offer space so that people who really do want to leave don't feel any stigma attached to leaving a conversation?

Student 40: As a result, I did exactly that the next time a traumatic event came up. I asked my co-teacher in the homeroom environment. I said, "I'm going to step out of the room and offer space for students that want to step out, who don't want to engage and leave the conversation, because I've had that experience." Then, two or three students stepped out. I said, "We don't have to talk about anything if you don't want to. Do you want to talk about homework? We can just stay in the hallway and just be here for a little bit if you want to."

Giving them that space and opportunity but I would have only known that had this-- If I didn't have this other experience I wouldn't have thought of that. Offering that and having a co-teacher in the classroom that will stay with the other kids that wanted to process and facilitate and modeling the "it's okay to step out". I'm starting the conversation but I'm going to step out for people that don't want to be a part of it. Being able to do that. I was fortunate and thankful because if I didn't have another teacher in the room it would be hard for me to model that.

Eli: It goes back to these questions we're understaffed. You were in a district where you can do that and that probably in a lot of districts there wouldn't have been a second teacher, which is a whole other problem.

Student 39: I wasn't--I was observing a classroom recently where students the watching the beginning of Amistad where it's really awful. She said, "If you need to step out you may step out. If you need to close your eyes you can close your eyes. Whatever you need to do you can do it." Nobody stepped out but some people did close their eyes. Then afterward some people didn't speak in the conversation.

Because this was clear to me this was something she did every time that they did anything that would be a difficult conversation. It offers space for kids to not participate if they didn't feel. Again it's a school where the kids have-- They don't have co-teachers in all the rooms, but the kids have the freedom and the space. They can go to the library. They can go someplace else if they need to leave a class.

This is allowed. Not every school does that. I've been in schools where it's just-- These kids need-- They need space sometimes.

Eli: I was trying to think of a situation where I feel I could have stepped back more. I got in this huge fight with this principal of this school. One of the kids I work with went to. I felt at the time I was really advocating for this kid, I was really in the right, but I think in retrospect there were bridges that I burned and getting in that fight might have, in long run, made it harder for me to advocate for that young person.

Because then I was just so persona non grata in that school. People were like get this-- Just get out of the school. I get this kid out of school, get me out of this school. It's hard to figure out how to push back against systems in a strategic way, to what extent this can't-- This principal was doing something that's clearly illegal but also that in calling her out, her authority was really challenged in a place that she felt she really controlled. She's felt really threatened. I was much younger than her. She's probably 20 years, 30 years older than me. I don't work at the school. Also, there's a big insider outsider dynamic. It was just-- yes.

Student 39: Maybe somebody inside the school couldn't have challenged her. Even though it caused a lot of conflicts and they wanted to get rid of you, there was risk for you but in the end, maybe it did actually tip the scale. Unless there was a reaction. I don't know in that situation.

Eli: No, they were people in the school who did. I'm friends with one of the special education teachers in that school who's really awesome and really supportive students in ways that I don't think all the teachers in that school are. I think he really did want to, but it was like "I can't because I-- This is my boss--" Exactly, but it still felt then I was like, "Now, I can never have a conversation with this principal again."

Student 40: It's strategy and political savvy. Hard to learn. Hard to teach, too.

Gretchen: I'm going to ask you to return to the table you started at. We're going to take a break in a minute but before we take a break we're going to pause. See if folks have things they want to add to their organizers. Go ahead and return to the table you started at.

[background conversation]

Once you get back to the table where you started the day, where your things are, just take a minute to think and you can either do this individually or as a group if you prefer, it's totally up to you, about whether or not there are big ideas that you might want to add to your organizer from the conversations you've just had. I'm going to give you about six minutes to do this. Then we will take a break and when we come back will get into our -- We'll start talking about the tensions a little more deeply in terms of a few specific ones. Take a few minutes either individually or as a group just to think about what might you want to add to your organizer.

Kirsten: Morgan shared an interesting anecdote about being in a community that was similar to actually Carlyn. Something you shared also earlier that she in her environment was open to transness, and then encouraged the students to speak out in a public forum and present a project that she had done about being trans, which

then led to members of the community being WTF basically because of being very transphobic outside of the school. That made me think about this question of about how we build relationships with youth and their families in communities that hold values that are different than our own.

How we can create careful and thoughtful approaches to creating space for their voice that's also a safe place. Opening space for their voice in a place where I know as a grownup there won't be negative repercussions for their honesty rather than the opposite where it's, go speak out your truth even though it's not safe for them, because they're going to live in this place for the rest of their lives potentially, which I thought was an interesting thing to think about.

Carlyn: Maybe sometimes making that clear to actually talking with students about. Because I know as a young person had a hard time. Distinguishing where was safe, understanding that it was okay to do things one way in one place in a different way somewhere else. It's just recognizing which-

Kirsten: You don't always got to-- [crosstalk] But then it feels sometimes you're not bringing your whole self and when you're young that's really hard, it's really, how do I--

Gretchen: We've got about a minute.

Student 1: This is just an observation but a lot of these strategies seem like characteristics. Openness, honesty. We talked about flexibility a lot in a bunch of our groups. It's not even concrete, like here's a framework to work with. It's just intrinsic mindset in part of your personality.

Carlyn: That's so crazy. Those things can be skills in our [crosstalk] .

Student 1: Yes, that's true.

Kirsten: Just decide not to.

Carlyn: Our Education teacher says that it's not. That it is a personality thing or that it's part of who you are and not something that you can develop. We're not ever taught that it's important.

Kirsten: Yes, that's a shame.

[laughter]

Carlyn: No, but we're not.

Kirsten: That's a great point.

You're not wrong and you're not saying anything crazy.

[laughter]

Carlyn: We got all the rant on video.

[laughter]

Kirsten: No, I think [crosstalk]

Carlyn: Delete, delete.

[laughter]

Kirsten: I do think, though, that we don't say like, "Learning how to communicate is as important as learning how to add and subtract. We make being a strong, confident, safe communicator something that they're supposed to just figure out.

Student 1: It's awful.

Kristen: That flexibility and honesty and transparency are things they're supposed to just-- We model them, so they learn them, but why is there no structure to that?

Student 1: This is kind of an aside, but at HKS, they really pride themselves on like building these "soft skills", which I was surprised and impressed by and it's sad that I have to come to grad school to learn how to be a good leader and learn how to communicate effectively.

Kristen: Why did it take so long to be part of a curriculum?

Emily: Exactly. Yes. I wonder if there's a tension between being realistic with youth. I'm looking at the question with how can we-- [crosstalk]

Gretchen: Okay, five, four, three, two, one. We're going to take a 10-minute break. When we come back from break, I'm going to share out four big tensions-- We're going to take a 10-minute break. When we come back from break, I'm going to share out four big tensions that come up often in the work. I'm going to tell you a little bit more about them and describe them a little bit more, but the general tensions are on the board. If you want to take a quick look at them while you go on break, you can do that.

When we come back-- Actually, you know what, sorry, I just made a strategic change in decision. I'm going to tell you a bit about them now and then when we come back, I'm going to ask you to go ahead and think about where you want to sit when we come back. The first possible tension to be talking about for this last part of class is around building trust and building authentic relationships. That question is around this notion that building trust and building authentic relationships are key to doing the work as we have up here. Yet those things make both adults and youth vulnerable.

The question there is around how we balance bridges and boundaries so that relationships are best able to positively impact both groups of people. This question really comes out of Duncan-Andrade's article and this idea about the strengths of vulnerability that come through in that article. Also the silence in that article around the challenges of vulnerability and the ways in which boundaries can actually be protective, sometimes, for both adults and youth. This first question is around how we think about bridges and boundaries so that relationships can positively impact both adults and youth.

The second question is around this tension between the product and the process. How do we build authentic relationships with youth when we're under a lot of pressure to produce something. You can think about that in the context of a classroom, where their standards and curriculum or in the context of a project where there's a sort of end-goal or an action goal, right? This is a question that I feel like we've talked a lot about around how do we balance the competing priorities of our work, who gets to drive that decision, and in youth-lead spaces, should the youth get to make decisions about which relationships are important and which or not? Or do we still have a role as adults in shaping those kinds of decisions?

The third tension is around how we prioritize relationships with youth when we work in institutions that follow a legal bottom line. This gets back to these questions about mandated reporting that were raised earlier and trust. What does it mean to protect ourselves and navigate our own morality in the context of institutions that have very rigid rules about what relationships and morality should look like?

Then the last tension, and don't worry, you'll see these again, is around this question that's come up a lot this year in particular, about building relationships with youth when their families and communities have different values than our own. For us, this year, what I've been hearing is that a lot of you have spoken about going back to communities that are either more conservative or more homogeneous than HGSE. Thinking about the tensions of what it means to build relationships in those contexts. Meaning tensions around pushback from community and parents, the danger of students experiencing isolation or confusion as they begin to develop critical consciousness, and the danger of disrespecting or failing to honor elders and families is in the processes that we're engaging in.

Here, the question is, "What does it mean to build authentic relationships in a context where the way we would normally think about our authentic relationships may be at odds with what other adults are demanding from young people?" Okay? These questions, they mirror the questions that you have on your handout. I'm going to leave this slide up, we're going to take a break for 10 minutes and we will meet back here at 17 after and we will break into groups. At that point, I'm going to label the tables so when you come back, you can move your stuff. Okay? Go ahead.

Okay, I'm going to ask people to move toward the table they want to be at. We've got one, two, three, and then two fours. Move toward the table you want to be at. One, two, three, and then two fours. We'll readjust if we need to. Think about which one you want to go to. Take all of your stuff. We're not going to move again.

Okay, on your table, I've given you a protocol. We're going to try using a protocol today because there was some feedback last week that it would be helpful to come out of this with something a little more concrete. What I'm going to ask you to do is in your group, to use this protocol to think about the question. What it says is to start by reading the prompt out loud, and that's just the prompt that I'm going to bring to you.

Then the second thing you're going to do is to go around in a circle and react to the prompt with your gut emotional answer. If you want, you can try to explain what you think lies underneath your answer. Then, you're going to get analytic for a moment and as a group, you're going to brainstorm the questions, factors, and ideas that you would want to consider before coming to a conclusion about the question. Then you'll

read the prompt again, and then you'll discuss how you might resolve the question or tension and think a little bit about what you can share back out to the larger group. Okay?

Take a minute to look at this protocol and then I'm going to bring around the prompts so that people can read them aloud. Okay? Go ahead. Jess, can I borrow you for one second? Okay, it looks like a bunch of people have started, which is great. If you haven't started, again, you want to follow that protocol. Have someone read the question or the prompt out loud. Four is up on the board if you want it. Then start with your initial reactions and go through the protocol. I'm going to join a group and Jess is going to join a group, but feel free to interrupt us if your group has a question. Okay? We have about half an hour. 25 minutes to talk and then we'll do the share-out at the end Okay, go ahead.

Student 39: Okay, prompt. Should I read the tension number one, or do we know? I'll read both, okay. Building trust and building authentic relationships are key to doing this work and yet relationships make both youth and adults vulnerable. How do we balance bridges and boundaries so that relationships are best able to positively impact both people? Specific example, Duncan-Andrade talks a lot about writers being folk who are willing to walk beside the students. He doesn't talk as much about the role that clear expectations and boundaries can have in building positive relationships. What are the strengths and limitations of vulnerability, what responsibility do we have as adults when it comes to the vulnerability of our students or our own vulnerability with them?

Chase: Go around the circle and react to the prompt with your gut emotional answer.

I think one, it feels really weird to be like-- It's useful for me as the adult. I am having a reaction to that, but it's like, what does it mean to be at the center of it, in addition to my students, with my students? I'm having some kind of wrestling with that, but I think I would like to think through more. Also, vulnerability can sometimes be a way to ask other people to do work for you, or to like, "Hey students, I'm feeling hurt. I need you to comfort me." That's a very facile way to approach it, but I certainly recognize ways that I have done that in my teaching, and in professional development and other settings. Also, vulnerability is hard because I think I'm still working-- I've said this already on film, that I'm still working out stuff that happened 10 years ago, like pre-college when I was the age of kids that I teach.

Student 41: I think I have two reactions to both this question/that article. That article really resonates with me. I feel the writers, the teacher I don't always embody but really try to be. I really, really believe in that form of a teacher, and the valuing of showing up for kids at all points in the day, and after school, and **[unintelligible 02:31:39]** whenever that is because I would do that for any other person I had a relationship with in my life. I think of it-- it's how do we define-- "Do I categorize relationships and why would I show up for adults in ways I don't show up for kids?"

There's a reason that five years and I was super, super burned out and that wasn't sustainable. It's like, how do you be that sort of teacher that really shows up, or leans in all the time, and does all the work that Duncan-Andrade describes in the article? I think many of us have experienced doing and being part or at least trying to do-- Just

how do you do that in a way that is sustainable, because it's not sustainable for me to work a hundred hours a week. It's just not.

Maybe that's me, personally, but I don't want to feel like to be a great teacher and to be a human for my students and with my students, that I need to only be a teacher at all hours of the day, at all points in my life. That does make it about me to some extent, but I think that I have to do that to, then, be able to make it about my students because it's a self-care thing to some extent.

Student 42: I was thinking about a spoken word poetry assignment that I had my students at my last school do. I definitely expected them and encouraged them to take a risk in terms of being-- For a lot of them, performing an original poem in front of their class was a risk in itself, and that was a vulnerability that made them very uncomfortable. I had students say, "Can I have someone else perform it? Can I just have people look at it?" [chuckles]

They really didn't want to do that. I think a lot of them, too, based on what the prompt was, were going to end up saying personal things, and letting their classmates in, and this is at the end of the year. Presumably, they know each other really well already, and they still were nervous to open up in certain ways. My third year doing it, I had a student say, "Kojak," they called me that, and they were like, "Kojak, what are you going to write about? What's your poem about?" I was like, "Yes." This girl Micah, she was like, "Kojak, what are you writing about?" I said, "Micah, I'm not writing a poem. I'm assigning the poem. I'm not writing one," and she goes, "Because it's hard?" I was like, "Touché."

Then, I wrote a poem about my sister coming out to me, and then went first. I went first, and that was really hard for me and I felt super uncomfortable, but I opened up to them, and then they really responded to that. One, that I did the assignment, too. Then, two, that I took it seriously enough to write about something personal, and not just about grades and the education or whatever.

I think for me, vulnerability is really important because if I'm expecting my students to take risks themselves and with each other, then they have to see that modeled from me. I think it's also really crucial for the trust-building. Again, vulnerability is uncomfortable, but those moments of discomfort are often when really good learning happens. It is a balance and I feel that's something that you have to continually navigate, and make decisions and see what happens. It's going to depend on you and where you are and who the students in the room are, but I think it's really important for community-building and for continuing to push our students and, also, so we push ourselves as educators.

Student 43: The first thing came into my mind that I experienced building relationship within my students and I, I guess it's when I feel safe to expose my vulnerability to my students, it has to be something that I feel confident about, that I can deal with on my own. If I-- I'm just thinking-- I taught in Utah, in the States for two years, and then when I went back to China, I got divorced.

I can't remember when and how I talked about this in front of my students, but I did tell them. But during that time, I don't think it's an easy thing to talk about in front of Chinese students, but I did do it because I was just quite over it. Myself [sic] has

walked out of it, and I think it's the right thing to do in my life. It's a vulnerability, yes, but it still is not that harming to me, to talk about it. When I was looking at the prompt, I was thinking, "As teachers, if we're going to share something private and personal with the students, we have to be sure and confident that we can handle any consequences that's going to happen after sharing."

Student 39: I've picked this group because I love the imagery of the contrast between a bridge and a boundary. I was thinking about how bridges are sometimes boundaries. The border to Canada is often with a bridge, and trying to figure out-- There's a way that it's ascribing a limitation of access but still access. Whereas if it was, a yard with a fence versus a yard without a fence, there's a different an image that comes to mind. That's my gut reaction part of it. Then, everything that people said about vulnerability falls into that. Not really, but I don't know. [chuckles]

To get analytical, I feel like one way that understanding what the shape of that relationship looks like, is to set clear expectations. Particularly in the context of a project where you don't-- you may have a goal for the outcome, but you don't know whether the goal is going to move the needle as much as kids want to make sure that along the line, in order to build that trust, you are thinking about the ways in which the two sides of that, our vulnerabilities are the things that we risk by participating in projects that are activist projects or ways that we might risk our jobs or other things and being really honest with kids about what that is because I think it's hard to get commitment when they don't know what you're committing to.

That said, I've mostly worked in the arts, and so it's a different set of constraints, where we're thinking about what is the message of the thing that we're putting on the walls, and how is that-- Is it going to be heard? Is the imagery in it? Something that people will understand and how do we make it understandable, and what stories are we going to tell and how do we get the youth stories and the youth voices elevated in that process? Now, I'm kind of rambling so I think I'm going to get analytical to Chase.

Chase: I'm wondering about if this is one-- it might be useful for like one person to just kind of jot down whatever comes up. I think you and I are both doing that, so maybe that's good enough. You're doing it, too. Never mind.

Student 41: It's cool, I'm not going to do that, then.

[laughter]

Chase: Words that stood out to me and phrases were like the word "Sustainability." I wonder what sustainability means in this, is that something that we need to be more secure and being aware of? Xing, I really resonated with feeling safe to expose my vulnerability, and you said, "Feeling confident that I can deal with it on my own." I wonder about that. Are there times when you mess up-- you accidentally share something that like, " I wish I hadn't shared that", so you can't not say it. You can't unsay it, so what do you do with it?

Something that I'm thinking about, and this idea, Alita, of clear expectations. I wonder, can we think about expectations as helpful and also think about expectations as constraining? A word that I keep coming back to is the word

"Flexibility," and where does flexibility fit in here, in terms of flexibility in ourselves, flexibility in the room, flexibility like year to year?

Where sometimes a class, Courtney, might be like, "I don't want my teacher to share their poem", but another class went maybe like, "Kojak didn't share the poem and is so ridiculous." I'd say, outside of this year, I haven't thought about the very different continuity of year to year as a teacher. I'm wondering if that has anything to do with this, that maybe we should be thinking about a discrete group, or a discrete time, or a discrete year. Where does flexibility fit in?

Student 38: When I was thinking of expectations, I guess I was forgetting that teacher jargon is, "Expectations are rules." I was thinking more of like the outcomes, the goals.

Chase: I feel like that outcomes and goals are teacher jargon.

Student 38: Yes.

Chase: In a way, it's scary. I don't know.

Student 38: Yes, that's fine. We'll be fine.

Student 42: I think that there's also expectations about how [unintelligible 02:43:17] about how you engage with people.

[Background conversation]

Student 3: Yes.

Student 38: [laughs] Sorry. I just wanted to clarify because it didn't occur to me when I first said it, but that was what it was meant to be taken as. I just wanted to make sure.

Student 41: Cool.

[laughter]

I don't have anything to say about expectations, right now. Something that you made me think of, Xing, is this idea of-- I don't know if privilege is the right word, but I agree that I feel like I want to feel safe in sharing something. Also, that's a choice I get to make that my students don't get to make, so what is that? Are we authentically building an equal relationship? Is equal the goal? To what extent, if ever, is it appropriate for me to share something I haven't dealt with? Because like it's modeling. And to what extent is that potentially traumatizing, or asking kids to do the work for you? Where-- I don't know, I'm just like, "What does that mean?"

Also related to sustainability, I'm thinking about potentially codependent relationships. I think many of us have either experienced or seen, or at least I know I have, when you or somebody else becomes so close with a student that it-- not inappropriate, but if you were to leave the school or you were no longer in that student's life, it would be traumatizing for that student. What is that? How does that-- Is that actually a positive and productive relationship? How do you show up for a kid

and show up all the time in the way that article talks about and not have it become a problem? If, at some point, you are no longer physically in that space anymore, or they're not in that space anymore or whatever it is. You can't-- How do you not become that student's only coping mechanism?

Student 42: Yes. Going along with that-- That plus what you said about dealing with something on your own, I feel like it's really important that we realize that we exist in a space that's larger than just our classroom. Our students can come to us, but they also have peers and they can go to other adults. I certainly have had moments where I've gone to other adults in the school, like the dean of students-- Actually, one of my colleagues had a freshman boy come up to him and thought he was dying because he had had a wet dream and didn't know what that-- He was from mainland China, and had never had sex-ed or talked about that and literally was like, "I'm dying, I have to go to the hospital."

Then, he was like, "What happened?", and he explained it. My colleague was like, "Wow." Then he was like, "How am I going to have this conversation?" He was like, "You're not dying, believe me when I tell you you are not dying. We're going to like come by [unintelligible 02:46:29] tomorrow night, we'll talk about it." In the meantime, he texted me and was like, "What do I do?" because he was new. I was like, "Talk to like the dean of students who teaches health and she'll-- She's great, she is so good with freshmen, especially." He had a conversation with her, debriefed with me to just be like, "This is my life, right now, as a teacher."

Then, he had the conversation, but then he followed up with the dean of students, he followed up with the student's advisor. I think even if something's really hard, know that we, too, just like we want our students to reach out for help, we can reach out for help. We don't have to be totally alone in our vulnerability. I know that we so often want to have the right answer and we want to be able to handle shit on our own, but so often we can't, or we shouldn't expect ourselves to.

Because, yes, things happen. He teaches science, he knows how to talk about anatomy, but then with this moment with this individual student, it's like, "Oh my God. I've never had to have that conversation before. What do I do?" I don't know, it can be really delicate, but I think we have to remember that we're not alone and we can reach out for help.

Chase: A quick response to that, is just this idea of bridges among the adults. How can bridges among adults maybe model bridges with students? Or just be like, "I know you do this really well, Courtney, and I suck at it right now, I'd love some help to think it through." Every time we see a classroom as a discrete space, we're also installing a boundary in a kind of way, but sometimes we also have to do that.

Student 41: Maybe a way to build on that, as a question, is how might the community around an individual relationship, are they like support or hinder that relationship?

Student 42: Again, either fuel this kind of co-dependence feeling of "we have to do this for each other," and not [unintelligible 02:48:29] student feeling like, "You're the only one I can go to", rather than, "I feel like there's a number of adults that I can go to," and for a teacher to think, "I don't have to shoulder this myself." Identity

comes into that. If you're the only out faculty, or if you're a gay faculty who's not out because you could be fired, and you're helping students covertly. Sometimes, you are going to have to maybe deal with it on your own, but then maybe you can reach out to an organization or something like that, I don't know. It can be tough but getting help outside and building bridges outside is always helpful.

Student 43: What we've been talking about reminds me something about cultural factors. I don't know if it's concerned with our topic but anyway, it's like when we were talking about sometimes we, either adults or young people, they can reach out for help, but it depends on which kind of cultural environment they grow up in. For instance, for Chinese people, we're not so used to that. We are basically too accustomed to dealing with our own feelings, and even, sometimes, young people won't even talk about sensitive issues with their own parents, not to mention teachers.

They won't expose their feelings to their peers either. I think those are boundaries for us to-- If me [sic] , for instance, standing on my own perspective, if I want to build close relationships between my students, there will be no taboos, but I have to, how do you say, open up myself first? Even peel myself open [chuckles] to show my vulnerability. That's why I'm saying I have to be sure that I can do it on my own first, and then I can reach out for them and to help them, in a sense. I don't know.

Chase: I wonder what would happen if we put the mic in the middle and we all talk to it so it could allow us to a conversation. I don't know if that will work.

Student 38: Meanwhile, I'll read the-- Should I read the prompt first? Okay. Building trust and building authentic relationships are key to doing this work, and yet relationships make both youths and adults vulnerable.

[Background conversation]

Okay. I'll start over again. We use mics in a lot of my classes. It's weird but anyway.

[Background conversation]

Yes, it takes time. Building trust and building authentic relationships are key to doing this work, and yet relationships make both youth and adults vulnerable. How do we balance bridges and boundaries so that relationships are best able to positively impact both people? Specific example, Duncan-Andrade talks about the **[unintelligible 02:52:00]** being folk who are willing to walk the walk beside their students. He doesn't talk as much about the role that clear expectations and boundaries can have in building positive relationships. What are the strengths and limitations of vulnerability? What responsibility do we have as adults when it comes to the vulnerability of our students or our own vulnerability with them?

Chase: Something that I'm thinking about and I'd love to hear folks thoughts on-- The question is, as a group discuss the prompt, how you as individuals or collectively might resolve this question tension? The first part is building off of my last point is, "Collaborate with and connect with staff." I also think like What would be really useful for me is to get some data on how students feel about it. Not in an explicit way of like, "I might get vulnerable in class, kids," but like, in what ways do you feel

comfortable expressing your feelings? In what ways do you feel-- What are the spaces where you feel safe? In the beginning of a class, in a form that I hand out or something. I'm wondering about that. I don't know.

Student 42: Did you want to go next?

Student 41: I just wanted to relate it to one thing. Damn it. What was it? Additionally, if we think about within the space versus outside the space and building on that, I've had students name to me before that a tension they have is even when there's a space that is safe within that space. As soon as they leave, they go into other classes, hallway spaces that aren't safe. It, then, actually ends up like-- I've had students voice that it limits their ability to feel safe within the space that is safe because they feel like the safety could be co-opted in the less safe spaces or somehow something vulnerable could then get-- somebody might hear it. I don't know if I'm making sense, but this idea that I can't be safe in a safe space because of the unsafe spaces around the safe space.

Student 42: School climate and getting a sense of the school climate and thinking about different spaces is definitely important. As a school, you need to get a sense. I also think I've seen teachers bristle at feedback from students. Again, if we're going to accept the whole vulnerability thing, that we need to accept feedback. Even in one of the readings we had for HGSE, leading up to orientation was from that book about feedback, kinds of feedback that you offer. We give feedback to students all the time and then often really struggle to accept it, especially from them. We give feedback to our professors here, we read the feedback from years past to get a sense of "is this class for me?"

I think teachers need more practice in like, not being called out, but in receiving feedback from students and that schools can really benefit from regularly collecting feedback from students about different things. That'll help with community building. I think, too, if a teacher messes up and feels bad, in the feedback process, I think restoration of relationships is also really important. If you mess up, and a student calls you out for it, and you're like, "Wow. Yes, I messed up." Or even before a student calls you out, you could realize that you-- like my girlfriend's colleague realized, after the fact, that he misgendered a student in public in the cafeteria, and then was like, "Oh, shoot." He was like, "I don't know what to do.

Do I address it with the student? Would that make it worse? Do I just fix it next time? But I want to apologize. How do I--" He didn't know how to navigate that. I think also working on how do we restore relationships with youths when we have caused harm unintentionally or intentionally and need to explain that? I think being willing to do that-- because you can easily because you're in a position of power, just not apologize and eventually, things will move on but that's shitty. [chuckles] Just being able to follow through with the things that come from being vulnerable.

Student 38: I was thinking about connecting, basically, all through the points that you guys were talking about. Thinking about how we define what a safe space is. I was at this conference last year about this time where we were talking about brave spaces, instead of safe spaces, and what would it mean to create a space in which students are able to be brave and able to stand up for things. One of the things that in the discussion was really interesting because we had people from all over

Southeast Michigan, some people were in Detroit city school, some were in Dearborn, some were from Ann Arbor AFC area. Those are all Cambridge, Somerville, Boston, East Boston, Roxbury, different kinds of neighborhoods.

In different neighborhoods, there were different values for that. Just really figuring out how to listen to what the professional learning community that you're involved in has to say about it, and then also what the students have to say about it and trying to figure out-- Then, the hard part is if the professional learning community has a different idea than the students, this is where, I think, some of the possibilities of YPAR come in.

Student 42: I think, too, bravery and vulnerability are often the same. It just depends on what you're talking about in the perspectives, but somewhat if you come out, you're making yourself vulnerable, but it's also a brave thing to do. I think those two are very closely linked and it's worth having conversation depending on the thing about how those are connected.

Student 41: I think a tension that this raises for me in thinking about how do we get to a place where we feel like we can answer this question or resolve the tension is thinking about the ways in which teacher retention, or a lack thereof, makes it impossible. Maybe not impossible, makes it much harder to solve this problem because if who you have relationships with and how your community supports that is changing 50% to 90% every year, then I feel like, then, you're starting over every year. I think we talked in another group really about how hard it is for new teachers to do this because of their lack of consistency to your point earlier. It seems like we almost have to go back a couple of steps and say, "How do we create the conditions to do the work before we think about how to do it?"

Student 42: If students are used to their teachers come like revolving door, they're not going to trust that they're going to be there. It's like, "You're not-- Why should I put energy into a relationship with you when you're going to leave."

Gretchen: Okay. Five, four, three, two, one. I didn't listen in because I was in a conversation which was really great and helpful for me, personally. I didn't push you to have to get to the part where you decided what to share out, but I just want to see if there are a few folks, maybe one from each group or one from each question, who would be willing to share something that they thought about. It can be something-- an insight that came up in your group that you think is worth sharing for others.

If there are notes, I didn't ask you to take notes but I'm happy to type up notes if people have them to share across groups. The group that was thinking about balancing bridges and boundaries in order to positively impact both adults and youth. Any insights that came up from your group that you would want to share? Considerations? Alita?

Alita (Student 38): We talked a lot about vulnerability in this and we were talking about ways in which we as teachers have been vulnerable in our classrooms. Then we were talking about how that relates to bigger systems. Thinking about what it takes to create a space where students can be vulnerable and where we can be vulnerable. Then, we were thinking about some of the systemic issues that might need to be addressed in order to make that easier across the board. About how

when teacher retention is low, it's really hard to develop trust with students because you don't have a professional learning community to support a teacher who is doing work like this. Then, it's harder to make that happen.

Gretchen: Awesome. The group who was thinking about how we prioritize relationships with youth within this-- No, sorry, we went this way. How we balanced the benefits of relationships with the urgency of the work. That was my group. Anyone want to share an insight. Heather? Heather drew a picture? That's life-changing? I'm not going to lie.

Heather (Student 27): It's hard because you can't see it, but it's a two by two matrix. Imagine a two by two matrix, and on one axis is the relationships piece and on the other axis is the urgency. You could imagine four situations, low relationship, low commitment to relationships, low urgency, high commitment to relationships, low urgency and so on. You can figure out what those combinations are. Each of those quadrants actually fills some sort of purpose that you could imagine meaningful things happening in each of those quadrants, depending on like what you hope to get out of the given interaction or work and what you need in that moment.

One that we were talking about was low urgency, high relationships that would really focus on safety and care. Whereas high urgency, something that's really urgent, but you aren't totally focused on building relationships. That could be a space where you're really focused on efficiency. Whereas to get to that upper quadrant, where your high relationships, high urgency, if you need something that is sustainable over time, that might be where you need to land, where you need to be really heavily investing in both of those. There might be other outcomes where you don't need to as heavily invest in both of those things, as you make decisions about how to find that balance point.

Gretchen: The group that was thinking about prioritizing relationships, within the structures of institutions that follow a bottom line. You had a lot of microphones. I'm just going to let you talk. Any thoughts that you want to share?

Emily: Yes, we basically, we were discussing this within the context of guidelines around sharing numbers between teachers and students or teachers driving students, and how a lot of these institutional level questions and discussions need to be centralized on and revisited, revisit the question of what's best for kids. That gets lost in a lot of that dialogue in decision making. If this is going to ensure-- If I'm able to call my student to make sure that they're able to get to school on time, that's going to be better for them than if I wasn't allowed to.

Gretchen: Yes. Great. Working with other adults to figure out how to make that happen. Thank you. Then, lastly, we had two groups that were around building relationships with youth when their families and communities hold different values than our own. Any insights from either of these groups that people are willing to share? Maybe one or two.

Student 19: I think we talked about understanding if there-- Acknowledging and addressing if there are power dynamics in the different relationship in between those different values. We also talked about identifying values in culture and being sure that we don't generalize what that means for our young people. We also talked about

the importance of, for certain **[unintelligible 03:04:41]** having a conversation, helping students to navigate the different messages that they're getting.

If they're outside communities are telling them one message, and then in school or in a classroom, we're telling them another message, how do you navigate and balance that? Being able to support them in that process, but also being able to do that in a way that doesn't degrade the communities that they're coming from.

If it's a specific action or thing that the students are engaging in and doing that's not accepted within the school for whatever reasons. Making sure that we're addressing the difference in policies and in laws, just to why that can't be addressed, but not **[unintelligible 03:05:18]** saying this behavior is something that is inherently bad or something, but allowing students to be able to understand the difference between " a time and a place for everything." Where's the place that this is acceptable or not?

Then, even if it comes up that this is something that the students agree should be happening, then what are the stuff that we can do to actually change that, to make sure that the students are being heard in that space? Helping them to really be able to navigate the different messages that they're getting and then what are the steps that students can take to make sure that each community or each institution, they feel supported within.

Gretchen: Anything that's last group want to add? You don't have to, but anything you would add from your conversation?

Student 44: Yes, we talked about, although you want to honor the culture and ideas that students are bringing from their home, it gets really complicated when these ideas might be violent ideas, harmful, oppressive ideas. We talked a lot about transphobia, homophobia, racism and how that tension between, "Okay, we want to value the family's ideology, but then what harm and violence is that going to cause into the classroom?" Then, the role of the teacher of not wanting to stay neutral, but then also not one to indoctrinate a certain viewpoint.

Gretchen: Great. Okay. We need to transition out as always. It's moved too fast for me, the time. If you have notes that you are willing to share with us on your organizer and, or if you have a rubric, hand those to Jess or myself on your way out and we will compile them and get your feedback on them. We're going to transition out with a video from Morgan. Morgan do you want to say anything about that?

Morgan: Yes, so I knew I wanted to center native youth voices, but I was having a hard time choosing, but ultimately I decided to center-- I wanted to focus on native men. Just to give you a little context, maybe heard about **[unintelligible 03:07:14]** , or even what went on with Sherman Alexie, where he's been accused of sexual violence. Native men had been receiving a lot of negative attention in the media. I really wanted to honor their **[unintelligible 03:07:26]** resilience of native youth.

This is also taken from an organization, TOCA, which stands for Tohono O'odham Community. Even though elders are the present in this video, I think it really bring us up **[unintelligible 03:07:40]** what shared power looks like in indigenous communities and how that looks very differently of maybe how we've talked about it

here because if it wasn't for the elders on **[unintelligible 03:07:50]** you would see that youth wouldn't have known about these **[unintelligible 03:07:53]** .

Gretchen: Awesome. Thanks, Morgan.

[Start of video]

Speaker 1: And it's smaller. It's a 60-day corn. It's really, really cool, but it's rare. It's too rare that we don't have any seeds right now. I don't know what we're going to do. Any ideas?

Speaker 2: I got it.

Adrian, I wanted to talk to you about something, but I have this really good idea. This idea is about if we can all get together and plant more corn seeds. What do you think about that?

Adrian: I think it's a good idea, that we should do that.

Speaker 2: I had this idea on planting more corn because our corn seeds are going extinct, and we might have no more corn seeds. I'm asking everybody if they can help us produce more corn seeds, so we can have seeds for the next coming planting year. I'm asking, guys, if you can help us plant more corn seeds. Thank you.

[Applause]

[Chanting in foreign language]

[End of video]

[Applause]

Gretchen: Thank you, Morgan. Have a lovely week. Don't forget to check out the Instagram account and drop off your handouts if you have anything.

[03:10:07] [END OF AUDIO]